

# ON THE EXISTENCE OF INCOMPRESSIBLE SURFACES IN CERTAIN 3-MANIFOLDS. II

WOLFGANG HEIL

We are concerned with the following question: If  $M$  is the closure of the complement of a regular neighborhood of a knot in  $S^3$  and if  $\pi_1(M)$  contains the fundamental group  $\mathfrak{F}$  of a closed (orientable) surface  $F$  of genus  $g$ , does there exist a nonsingular surface  $F$  of genus  $g$  in  $M$  such that  $i_*\pi_1(F) = \mathfrak{F}$ ? If this is the case we say that  $\mathfrak{F}$  is carried by  $F$ . In this note we show that if  $\mathfrak{F}$  is a normal subgroup of  $\pi_1(M)$  then  $\mathfrak{F}$  is not carried by a surface  $F \subset M$ .

In [5] Waldhausen gave an example of an irreducible (orientable) 3-manifold  $N$  such that  $\pi_1(N)$  contains the fundamental group of a torus which is not carried by a nonsingular torus (in fact this  $N$  does not contain any incompressible closed orientable surface). The referee also pointed out a paper by Feustel and Max [7], in which it is shown that if  $M$  is a complement of a nonprime knot a fundamental group of a torus need not be carried by a torus.

We are in the piecewise linear category. The notation and definitions are those of [3].

## 1. Manifolds having the fundamental group of a surface.

**PROPOSITION 1.** *Let  $M$  be a  $P^2$ -irreducible 3-manifold. If  $\pi_1(M) = \mathfrak{F}$ , where  $\mathfrak{F}$  is the fundamental group of a closed surface  $F \neq S^2, P^2$ , then  $M$  is a line bundle over  $F$ .*

**PROOF.** (a) We show that  $\partial M \neq \emptyset$ :

Represent  $\pi_1(M)$  as  $F_1 * \mathbf{Z}F_2$ , where  $F_1$  and  $F_2$  are free groups (e.g.  $F_1 = \{a_1, b_1, \dots, a_{g-1}, b_{g-1}\}$ ,  $F_2 = \{a_g, b_g\}$ ,  $F_1 \supset \{\prod_{i=1}^{g-1} [a_i, b_i]\} \approx \mathbf{Z} \approx \{[a_g, b_g]\} \subset F_2$ ). Then by a well-known construction (see [5]; the proof of Satz 1.2(2) holds also in case that  $M$  is nonorientable and  $P^2$ -irreducible) we find an incompressible surface  $G$  in  $M$ ,  $\partial G = \partial M \cap G$ , such that  $i_*\pi_1(G)$  is conjugate in  $\pi_1(M)$  to a subgroup of  $\mathbf{Z}$  (where  $i: G \rightarrow M$  is inclusion). If  $M$  were closed,  $G$  would be closed, which is impossible.

(b) We claim that every boundary component of  $M$  is incompressible.

For, suppose  $G \in \partial M$  is compressible, then by the loop theorem and Dehn lemma [4] we find a disc  $D \subset M$ ,  $\partial M \cap D = \partial D \neq \emptyset$  on  $G$ . Cutting  $M$  along  $D$  we get one component  $M'$  or two components  $M_1, M_2$  and

---

Received by the editors June 2, 1969.

such that either  $\pi_1(M) \approx \pi_1(M') * \mathbf{Z}$  or  $\pi_1(M) \approx \pi_1(M_1) * \pi_1(M_2)$ . Since  $\mathfrak{F} = \pi_1(M)$  is not a free product and not cyclic, the first case can not occur and in the second case we have, say  $\pi_1(M_1) = 1$ . Since  $M_1$  is irreducible, it follows that  $M_1$  is a ball and hence  $\partial D \simeq 0$  on  $G$ , a contradiction.

(c) Let  $G$  be a boundary component of  $M$ . Then  $i_*\pi_1(G) \subset \pi_1(M)$  (where  $i: G \rightarrow M$  is inclusion) is a subgroup of  $\mathfrak{F}$ . Since  $G$  is compact, this subgroup is of finite index in  $\mathfrak{F}$ . (For let  $p: \tilde{G} \rightarrow G$  be the covering of  $G$  for which  $p_*\pi_1(\tilde{G}) = i_*\pi_1(G)$ . If  $p_*\pi_1(\tilde{G})$  were not of finite index in  $\mathfrak{F}$ , then  $\tilde{G}$  would not be compact and  $\pi_1(\tilde{G})$  would be a free group.) Consider the lifting  $\tilde{M}$  of  $M$  which is associated to  $i_*\pi_1(G)$ .  $\tilde{M}$  is compact, irreducible (see the argument in [3]; proof of Theorem 2), and contains a closed incompressible boundary component  $G'$  such that  $\pi_1(\tilde{M}) = \pi_1(G')$ . If  $G'$  would be the only boundary component, then the double  $D(M)$  would be a closed irreducible manifold with  $\pi_1(D(M)) \approx \pi_1(G')$ , the fundamental group of a closed surface, which is impossible by (a). Hence  $\tilde{M}$  has a (compact) boundary component  $G'' \neq G'$ . Now it follows from Lemma 5.1 of [6] (see [2, Proposition 5] in the nonorientable case) that  $\tilde{M} = G' \times I$ . Hence the covering  $\tilde{M} \rightarrow M$  is one or two-sheeted and  $M$  is a line bundle over a closed surface by [6, 4.1] [2, Proposition 4].

REMARK. A somewhat related theorem has been proved by E. Brown and R. Crowell [1].

**2. Normal subgroups which are fundamental groups of surfaces.**

If  $F$  is a surface in  $M$ , let  $i_*$  denote the homomorphism induced by inclusion.

THEOREM 2. *Let  $M$  be a  $P^2$ -irreducible 3-manifold. Suppose there exists a 2-sided closed incompressible surface  $F \subset M$  such that  $i_*\pi_1(F)$  is a normal subgroup in  $\pi_1(M)$ . Then one of the following cases holds:*

- (a)  $M$  is a fibre bundle over  $S^1$  with fibre  $F$ .
- (b)  $M \approx F \times I$ .
- (c)  $M$  is a twisted line bundle over a closed surface  $G$  and  $F$  is parallel to  $\partial M$ .
- (d)  $F$  separates  $M$  into two twisted line bundles of type (c).

PROOF. If  $F$  does not separate  $M$ , let  $M' = \text{Cl}(M - U(F))$ ; if  $F$  separates  $M$ , let  $M'$  be a component of  $\text{Cl}(M - U(F))$ . We have inclusions  $F \xrightarrow{j} M' \xrightarrow{k} M$ . Since  $F$  is incompressible  $\ker k_* = 1$  and  $\ker j_* = 1$ . Choosing the basepoints for the fundamental groups in a suitable way, we may assume  $i_* = k_*j_*$ . Since  $i_*\pi_1(F)$  is normal in  $\pi_1(M)$  it follows that  $j_*\pi_1(F)$  is normal in  $\pi_1(M')$ . Hence the covering

$\tilde{M}'$  of  $M'$ , which is associated to  $j_*\pi_1(F)$ , is regular. Let  $p: \tilde{M}' \rightarrow M'$  be the covering map and let  $F' \subset \partial \tilde{M}'$  be a copy over  $jF \subset \partial M'$ , for which  $p|_{F'}$  is a homeomorphism.

If  $p: \tilde{M}' \rightarrow M'$  is a homeomorphism, then it follows from Proposition 1 that  $M'$  is a line bundle over a surface  $F^*$  which is homeomorphic to  $F$ .

If  $p$  is not a homeomorphism, then there exists a component  $F'' \in p^{-1}(F)$ ,  $F'' \neq F'$ .  $F''$  is a closed surface, since the covering is regular; (otherwise a closed curve  $l$  would lift to an arc in  $F''$ , but it lifts to a closed curve in  $F'$ ). Again it follows from [6, 5.1 and 4.1], [2, Propositions 5 and 4] that  $\tilde{M}' \approx F' \times I \approx F \times I$  and  $M'$  is a line bundle over a surface  $G$ . So either  $M'$  is a twisted line bundle over  $G$  and  $\partial M' = F$  (and  $F \rightarrow G$  is a 2-sheeted covering) or  $M' \approx G \times I$ . In the latter case  $M' \approx F \times I$ , since  $F \subset \partial M'$ .

There are the following cases to consider:

(i)  $F$  does not separate  $M$ .

Then there are two copies of  $F$  in  $\partial M'$  and  $M' \approx F \times I$ . This is a special case of case (a) of the theorem.

(ii)  $F$  separates  $M$  into two components  $M_1, M_2$ . Let  $F^*$  be a surface homeomorphic to  $F$ , let  $G$  be a surface for which  $F$  is a 2-sheeted covering and denote by  $LB(H)$  a twisted line bundle over a surface  $H$ .

( $\alpha$ )  $M_1 \approx F \times I, M_2 \approx F \times I$ .

( $\beta$ )  $M_1 \approx F \times I, M_2 = LB(F^*)$ .

( $\gamma$ )  $M_1 \approx F \times I, M_2 = LB(G)$ .

( $\delta$ )  $M_1 \approx LB(F^*), M_2 = LB(F^*)$ .

( $\epsilon$ )  $M_1 \approx LB(F^*), M_2 = LB(G)$ .

( $\eta$ )  $M_1 \approx LB(G), M_2 = LB(G)$ .

Case ( $\alpha$ ) implies case (b) of the theorem. In cases ( $\beta$ ) and ( $\gamma$ )  $M$  is obtained from  $M_2$  by attaching a collar ( $M_1$ ) to  $\partial M_2$ , which implies case (c) of the theorem, (in case ( $\beta$ ),  $F$  is a torus or a Kleinbottle, since  $\partial M_2 \approx F$  is a two-sheeted covering of  $F^* \approx F$ ). In cases ( $\delta$ ), ( $\epsilon$ ), ( $\eta$ )  $M$  is separated by  $F$  into two line bundles, which proves case (d) of the theorem. (In cases ( $\delta$ ) and ( $\epsilon$ ) it follows again that  $F$  is a torus or a Kleinbottle.)

**COROLLARY.** *Let  $M$  be the closure of the complement of a regular neighborhood of a knot in  $S^3$ . Suppose  $\pi_1(M)$  contains the fundamental group  $\mathfrak{F}$  of a closed surface as a normal subgroup. Then there is no 2-sided surface  $F \subset M$  which carries  $\mathfrak{F}$ .*

**PROOF.** By the theorem,  $M$  would satisfy (a), (b), (c) or (d). In cases (a) and (d)  $M$  would be closed, in case (b)  $M$  would have two

boundary components, and in case (c)  $G$  would be a Kleinbottle (since  $\partial M$  is a torus and  $M$  is orientable) and  $H_1(M)$  would be  $\mathbf{Z} \times \mathbf{Z}_2$ , a contradiction.

ADDED IN PROOF. In Theorem 1 of [3] we have to add the hypothesis that  $F$  has at most one boundary component. William Jaco kindly pointed out counterexamples to this theorem in case that  $F$  is a planar surface having more than one boundary component. If  $F$  would have more than 1 boundary component then (in the proof of the theorem) we cannot assume that  $H^{(1)}$  is a wedge of closed curves and then the map  $f|_{H \times 0 \cup \partial H \times I}$  can in general not be extended to  $H^{(1)} \times I$  such that  $f|_{H^{(1)} \times 1} \subset G$ .

#### REFERENCES

1. E. Brown and R. Crowell, *Deformation retractions of 3-manifolds into their boundaries*, Ann. of Math. (2) **82** (1965), 445–458. MR **31** #6236.
2. W. Heil, *On  $P^2$ -irreducible 3-manifolds*, Bull. Amer. Math. Soc. **75** (1969), 772–775.
3. ———, *On the existence of incompressible surfaces in certain 3-manifolds*, Proc. Amer. Math. Soc. **23** (1969), 704–707.
4. J. Stallings, *On the loop theorem*, Ann. of Math. (2) **72** (1960), 12–19. MR **22** #12526.
5. F. Waldhausen, *Gruppen mit Zentrum und 3-dimensionale Mannigfaltigkeiten*, Topology **6** (1967), 505–517. MR **38** #5223.
6. ———, *On irreducible 3-manifolds which are sufficiently large*, Ann. of Math. (2) **87** (1968), 56–88. MR **36** #7146.
7. Charles Feustel and N. Max, *On a problem of R. H. Fox*, (to appear).

RICE UNIVERSITY, HOUSTON, TEXAS 77001