

# ON THE EXISTENCE OF $L_{\infty\kappa}$ -INDISCERNIBLES

P. C. EKLOF

ABSTRACT. It is proved that if  $T$  is a countable theory of  $L_{\omega_1\omega}$  with enough axioms for Skolem functions and with arbitrarily large models, then for any order type, there is a model of  $T$  with a set of  $L_{\infty\kappa}$ -indiscernibles of that order type.

In this short note we answer in the affirmative a question of Chang [4] as to whether there exist  $L_{\kappa\kappa}$ -indiscernibles of any given order type. In fact we prove a somewhat stronger result since we show the existence of  $L_{\infty\kappa}$ -indiscernibles and we use a stronger definition of indiscernibles. Our result also gives a simpler proof of Chang's theorem on the existence of  $L_{\kappa\kappa}$ -indiscernibles of any well-ordered order type [4, Theorem 4]. (We thank Jon Barwise for some helpful discussions.)

In general we follow the notation of Chang [4] (so  $\kappa$  is always an infinite regular cardinal). Let  $L$  be a first order language with countably many relation, function, and constant symbols, and let  $\mathfrak{A} = \langle A, \cdot \cdot \cdot \rangle$  be a structure for  $L$ . An ordered subset  $X$  of  $A$  is said to be  $L_{\lambda\kappa}$ -indiscernible if for any subset  $Y$  of  $X$  of cardinality  $< \kappa$  and any order-preserving injection  $h: Y \rightarrow X$ ,

$$(\mathfrak{A}, y)_{y \in Y} \equiv_{\lambda\kappa} (\mathfrak{A}, hy)_{y \in Y}.$$

If  $L_{\infty\kappa}$  is the union of the infinitary languages  $L_{\lambda\kappa}$ , where  $\lambda$  ranges over all cardinals, we define  $L_{\infty\kappa}$ -indiscernibles analogously.

Let  $T$  be a countable theory of  $L_{\omega_1\omega}$ . There is a countable fragment  $\mathcal{L}_A$  such that  $T \subseteq \mathcal{L}_A$  (for the definition of  $\mathcal{L}_A$  see Barwise [1]). We consider only  $T$  and  $\mathcal{L}_A$  such that  $\mathcal{L}_A$  has enough function symbols and  $T$  includes axioms for all Skolem functions of formulas of  $\mathcal{L}_A$ . A necessary condition for  $T$  to have models with sets of  $L_{\infty\kappa}$ -indiscernibles of any order type is that  $T$  have models of arbitrarily large cardinality; this is sufficient as well.

**THEOREM.** *Let  $T \subseteq \mathcal{L}_A$  such that  $T$  has arbitrarily large models. If  $\mu$  is any order type, there is a model  $\mathfrak{A}$  of  $T$  such that  $\mathfrak{A}$  has a set of  $L_{\infty\kappa}$ -indiscernibles of order type  $\mu$ .*

**PROOF.** We may suppose that the cardinality  $|\mu|$  of  $\mu$  is  $\leq \kappa$ , since a set of  $L_{\infty\lambda}$ -indiscernibles is a set of  $L_{\infty\kappa}$ -indiscernibles if  $\lambda \geq \kappa$ . Sup-

---

Received by the editors December 7, 1969.

AMS Subject Classifications. Primary 0235.

Key Words and Phrases. Indiscernibles, infinitary languages,  $\eta_\alpha$ -set.

pose  $\kappa = \aleph_\alpha$ ; it suffices to prove that  $T$  has a model  $\mathfrak{A}$  with a set  $X$  of  $L_{\omega\kappa}$ -indiscernibles of order type  $\eta_\alpha$ , since  $\mu$  can be embedded in  $X$  [7, pp. 334–338].

We are assuming that models of  $T$  have Skolem functions for all formulas of  $\mathfrak{L}_A$ . Since  $T$  has arbitrarily large models, there is a model  $\mathfrak{A}$  of  $T$  with a set  $X$  of  $\mathfrak{L}_A$ -indiscernibles of order type  $\eta_\alpha$  (see [6]; if  $\mathfrak{L}_A = L_{\omega\omega}$  this is just the classical result of Ehrenfeucht-Mostowski [5]). We may suppose that  $\mathfrak{A} = \mathfrak{S}(X)$ , where  $\mathfrak{S}(X)$  is the Skolem hull of  $X$  (i.e. the submodel of  $\mathfrak{A}$  whose universe  $A$  is the closure of  $X$  under the Skolem functions of  $\mathfrak{L}_A$ ).

We claim that  $X$  is a set of  $L_{\omega\kappa}$ -indiscernibles in  $\mathfrak{A}$ . Let  $Y \subseteq X$  be of cardinality  $< \kappa = \aleph_\alpha$  and let  $h: Y \rightarrow X$  be an order-preserving injection. Let  $I$  be the set of all isomorphisms

$$f: S \rightarrow S'$$

of submodels  $S, S'$  of  $\mathfrak{A}$  such that  $Y \subseteq S, f|Y = h$ , and there exist  $U, U' \subseteq X$  such that  $|U| < \kappa, S = \mathfrak{S}(U), S' = \mathfrak{S}(U')$  and  $f|U$  is an order-isomorphism of  $U$  onto  $U'$ . Notice that  $I \neq \emptyset$  since, letting  $S = \mathfrak{S}(Y), S' = \mathfrak{S}(h(Y))$ , there is an extension of  $h$  to an isomorphism  $f: S \rightarrow S'$ . We claim that  $I$  has the following property:

- (\*) For any  $C \subseteq A$  such that  $|C| < \kappa$  and any  $f \in I$ , there are  $f', f'' \in I$  such that  $f \subseteq f', f \subseteq f'', C \subseteq \text{domain of } f',$  and  $C \subseteq \text{range of } f''$ .

It suffices to prove (\*), for it follows easily by an induction on formulas of  $L_{\omega\kappa}$  that

$$(\mathfrak{A}, y)_{y \in Y} \equiv_{\omega\kappa} (\mathfrak{A}, hy)_{y \in Y}$$

(see Calais [2]).

So suppose  $f: S \rightarrow S'$  is in  $I$  and  $U, U'$  are as in the definition of  $I$ . Given  $C \subseteq A, |C| < \kappa$ , there is a  $D \subseteq X, |D| < \kappa$ , such that  $C \subseteq \mathfrak{S}(U \cup D)$ . It is clear that in order to prove the existence of  $f'$  as required by (\*), it suffices to show that we can extend  $f|U: U \rightarrow U'$  to an order-monomorphism:  $U \cup D \rightarrow X$ . We may assume  $D \cap U = \emptyset$ . Define an equivalence relation on  $D$  by:  $x \approx y$  iff  $x$  and  $y$  determine the same cut of  $U$ . Write  $D = \bigcup_{\sigma < \tau < \kappa} D_\sigma$  as the union of pairwise disjoint equivalence classes  $D_\sigma, \sigma < \tau < \kappa$ . For any  $\sigma < \tau$ , let  $U = A_\sigma \cup B_\sigma$  where  $A_\sigma < D_\sigma < B_\sigma$ . Then  $f(A_\sigma) < f(B_\sigma)$  and  $|f(A_\sigma)| < \kappa, |f(B_\sigma)| < \kappa$ . So if

$$E_\sigma = \{x \in X: f(A_\sigma) < x < f(B_\sigma)\},$$

$E_\sigma$  is an  $\eta_\alpha$ -set. Therefore there exists an embedding

$$g_\sigma: D_\sigma \rightarrow E_\sigma.$$

Define  $f': U \cup D \rightarrow X$  by:  $f'(x) = f(x)$  if  $x \in U$ ;  $f'(x) = g_\sigma(x)$  if  $x \in D_\sigma$ . This gives the desired extension of  $f$ . In a similar manner we can prove the existence of  $f''$  extending  $f$  with  $C \subseteq \text{range of } f''$ . This completes the proof.

REMARKS. (1) If we assume the generalized continuum hypothesis then the proof is much simpler; for then there exists an  $\eta_\alpha$ -set  $X$  of cardinality  $\aleph_\alpha$ . Hence if  $h: Y \rightarrow X$  is an order-preserving injection and  $|Y| < \kappa$ ,  $h$  extends to an isomorphism  $h': X \rightarrow X$ . It is immediate that

$$(\mathfrak{A}, y)_{y \in Y} = {}_{\omega\kappa}(\mathfrak{A}, hy)_{y \in Y}.$$

(Compare the remark of Chang [3, p. 55].)

(2) Our method suffers from the same defect as that of Chang, namely the indiscernibles do not necessarily generate the model.

(3) If  $\kappa = \aleph_\alpha$  and  $\kappa \geq |\mu|$  the model  $\mathfrak{A}$  asserted to exist in the statement of the theorem can be chosen to have cardinality  $= 2^{\aleph_\beta}$  if  $\alpha = \beta + 1$ ;  $\sum_{\sigma < \alpha} 2^{\aleph_\sigma}$  if  $\alpha$  is a limit ordinal [7].

#### REFERENCES

1. J. Barwise, *Infinitary logic and admissible sets*, J. Symbolic Logic **34** (1969), 226–252.
2. J.-P. Calais, *La méthode de Fraïssé dan les langages infinis*, C. R. Acad. Sci. Paris **268** (1969), 785–788.
3. C. C. Chang, "Some remarks on the model theory of infinitary languages," *The syntax and semantics of infinitary languages*, Lecture Notes in Math., no. 72, Springer-Verlag, Berlin and New York, 1968, pp. 36–63.
4. ———, "Infinitary properties of models generated from indiscernibles," *Logic, methodology and the philosophy of science*. III, North-Holland, Amsterdam, 1968, pp. 9–21.
5. A. Ehrenfeucht and A. Mostowski, *Models of axiomatic theories admitting automorphisms*, Fund. Math. **43** (1956), 50–68. MR **18**, 863.
6. J. Keisler, *Model theory of  $L_{\omega_1\omega}$* , (to appear).
7. K. Kuratowski and A. Mostowski, *Set theory*, PWN, Warsaw and North-Holland, Amsterdam, 1968. MR **37** #5100.

YALE UNIVERSITY, NEW HAVEN, CONNECTICUT 06520