

## SETS OF POINTS OF DISCONTINUITY

RICHARD BOLSTEIN

**ABSTRACT.** In order that a subset  $F$  of a topological space coincide with the set of points of discontinuity of a real-valued function on the space, it is necessary that  $F$  be an  $F_\sigma$ -set devoid of isolated points. It is shown that this condition is also sufficient if the space is "almost-resolvable", and in particular if the space is either separable, first countable, locally compact Hausdorff, or topological linear.

**1. Introduction.** It is well known that the set of points of discontinuity of a real-valued function on a topological space  $X$  belongs to the class  $F_\sigma$  of countable unions of closed sets. An outline of the proof can be found in Hewitt and Stromberg [3, p. 78]. It is obvious that such a set can contain no isolated points of  $X$ . It is natural to ask this question: Does every  $F_\sigma$ -subset which contains no isolated points of  $X$  coincide with the set of points of discontinuity of some real-valued function on  $X$ ?

An affirmative answer to this question was given in the case of the real-line by W. H. Young [4] in 1907. In 1932, H. Hahn [1, p. 193] showed that in fact any metric space has this property. In this article we give an affirmative answer to the question for a large class of topological spaces, which includes, in particular, any space which is either first countable, separable, locally compact Hausdorff, or topological linear. Moreover, we characterize those  $F_\sigma$ -subsets of an arbitrary space which coincide with the set of points of discontinuity of a function with countable range.

In the next section we introduce the concept of "almost-resolvable" spaces, which is a generalization of the so-called resolvable spaces of E. Hewitt. The main results appear in §3.

**2. Almost-resolvable spaces.** Hewitt [2] calls a topological space *resolvable* if it is the union of two disjoint dense sets. In [2, p. 331] he shows that

- (a) a first countable space devoid of isolated points is resolvable, and
- (b) a locally compact Hausdorff space devoid of isolated points is resolvable.

---

Received by the editors April 10, 1972.

AMS (MOS) subject classifications (1970). Primary 54-XX, 54C30, 26A15; Secondary 54C50

Key words and phrases.  $DF_\sigma$ -space, resolvable, almost-resolvable,  $SI$ -space.

© American Mathematical Society 1973

We can now show that

(c) a linear topological space over a nondiscrete valuated field is resolvable.

For let  $K$  be a valuated field, that is, a field which admits an absolute value function  $a \rightarrow |a|$  of  $K$  into the nonnegative reals such that  $|a+b| \leq |a|+|b|$  and  $|ab|=|a||b|$  for all  $a, b$  in  $K$ , and such that  $|a|=0$  if, and only if,  $a=0$ . Then  $(a, b) \rightarrow |a-b|$  defines a metric on  $K$ , and if this metric is nondiscrete, then  $K$  has no isolated points in the metric topology. So by (a) above,  $K$  is resolvable. Let  $K_1$  and  $K_2$  be disjoint dense sets in  $K$ . Let  $X$  be a linear topological space over  $K$ , and  $B$  be any Hamel basis for  $X$ . It follows from the continuity of addition and scalar multiplication that the sets  $D_1$  and  $D_2$  of finite linear combinations of elements of  $B$  with coefficients in  $K_1$  and  $K_2$ , respectively, are disjoint and dense in  $X$ .

In Theorem 4 below we will require a slight generalization of resolvability. We first give a new characterization of resolvability.

**THEOREM 1.** *A topological space is resolvable if, and only if, it is a finite union of sets with void interiors.*

**PROOF.** The necessity is trivial. Assume now that  $X = D_1 \cup \dots \cup D_{n+1}$  where each  $D_k$  has void interior. On replacing each  $D_j$  by  $D_j \setminus \bigcup_{k < j} D_k$  we can assume that the sets are pairwise disjoint. If  $n=1$ , then  $D_1$  and  $D_2$ , each having void interior, are dense, so  $X$  is resolvable. Assume now that any space which is the union of  $n$  sets with void interiors is resolvable. Let  $U \subset X$  be any nonvoid open set. If  $D_{n+1}$  is dense in  $U$ , then  $U$  is resolvable (in the relative topology) since  $D_{n+1} \cap U$  has void interior in  $U$ . Otherwise, there is a nonvoid open set  $V \subset U$  disjoint from  $D_{n+1}$ . Since  $V = (D_1 \cap V) \cup \dots \cup (D_n \cap V)$ , it is resolvable by the induction hypothesis. We have shown that every nonvoid open set contains a nonvoid open resolvable subset. By [2, Theorem 20],  $X$  is resolvable.

**DEFINITION.** A topological space will be called *almost-resolvable* if it is a countable union of sets with void interiors.

Clearly, a resolvable space is almost-resolvable, and an almost-resolvable space has no isolated points. Note that if a space  $X$  contains a dense set which is a countable union of sets with void interiors, then  $X$  is almost-resolvable. It follows that

(d) a separable space with no isolated points is almost-resolvable.

We now construct examples of almost-resolvable spaces which are not resolvable. Following Hewitt [2], we call a topological space an *SI-space* if it has no isolated points and if no nonempty subset is resolvable in the relative topology.

**THEOREM 2.** (A) *There exists a separable  $T_1$ -space of any prescribed infinite cardinality which has no isolated points but is not resolvable. (It is*

almost-resolvable by (d).) (B) *There exists a completely regular Hausdorff space of any prescribed infinite cardinality which is an SI-space but is almost-resolvable.*

PROOF. First recall that if  $(X_\alpha)$  is any family of pairwise disjoint topological spaces, the free union of this family is the space  $X = \bigcup X_\alpha$  where a set  $U \subset X$  is open if, and only if,  $U \cap X_\alpha$  is open in  $X_\alpha$  for every  $\alpha$ . Since each  $X_\alpha$  is open in  $X$ , a set  $D \subset X$  is dense in  $X$  if, and only if,  $D \cap X_\alpha$  is dense in  $X_\alpha$  for every  $\alpha$ . It follows that  $X$  is resolvable (almost-resolvable) if, and only if, each  $X_\alpha$  is resolvable (almost-resolvable). Also,  $X$  is an SI-space if, and only if, each  $X_\alpha$  is an SI-space.

(A) Let  $X_1$  be any infinite set, and let  $D \subset X$  be a countably infinite subset. Define a topology on  $X_1$  by declaring a set to be open if, and only if, it contains all but finitely many elements of  $D$ . It is clear that, in this topology,  $X_1$  is a  $T_1$ -space devoid of isolated points, and since  $D$  is dense by construction,  $X_1$  is separable.

Now let  $X_2$  be any countably infinite set disjoint from  $X_1$ . By [2, Theorem 25],  $X_2$  can be endowed with a topology in which it is  $T_2$  and SI. Let  $X$  be the free union of  $X_1$  and  $X_2$ . Then  $\text{card}(X) = \text{card}(X_1)$ .  $X$  is separable,  $T_1$ , and devoid of isolated points, because  $X_1$  and  $X_2$  have these properties. Since  $X_2$  is not resolvable,  $X$  is not resolvable.

(B) Let  $J$  be any infinite set. For each  $\alpha \in J$ , let  $Y_\alpha$  be a countably infinite set and let  $X_\alpha = \{\alpha\} \times Y_\alpha$ . Then the sets  $X_\alpha$  are countably infinite and pairwise disjoint. By [2, Theorem 27], each  $X_\alpha$  can be endowed with a completely regular, Hausdorff, SI topology. Let  $X$  be the free union of the family  $(X_\alpha)_{\alpha \in J}$ . Then  $\text{card}(X) = \text{card}(J)$ . It is easy to verify that  $X$  is a completely regular, Hausdorff space. Since each  $X_\alpha$  is an SI-space,  $X$  is an SI-space. Since each  $X_\alpha$ , as a countable space with no isolated points, is trivially almost-resolvable,  $X$  is almost-resolvable.

REMARK. In part (A) of Theorem 2, we can replace  $T_1$  by Hausdorff if the prescribed cardinality is aleph null,  $c$ , or  $2^c$ . (It is well known that a separable Hausdorff space has cardinality at most  $2^c$ .) For in the proof of (A), one can take for  $X_1$ , the rationals,  $[0, 1]$ , or  $[0, 1]^{[0,1]}$  with the usual topologies.

3.  $DF_\sigma$ -spaces. We first characterize those  $F_\sigma$ -subsets of an arbitrary space which coincide with the set of points of discontinuity of a function with countable range.

THEOREM 3. *Let  $F$  be an  $F_\sigma$ -subset of a topological space  $X$ . In order that  $F$  coincide with the set of points of discontinuity of a real-valued function  $g$  on  $X$  such that  $g(F)$  is countable, it is necessary and sufficient that  $F$  be a countable union of sets with void interiors. In this case, the function  $g$  can be chosen so that  $g(X)$  is countable.*

PROOF. For the necessity, assume that there exists a function  $g$  on  $X$  whose set of discontinuities is precisely  $F$ , and such that  $g(F)$  is countable. Then if  $r \in g(F)$ , the set  $F \cap g^{-1}(r)$  has void interior (otherwise  $g$  would have a point of continuity in  $F$ ). Therefore

$$F = \bigcup \{F \cap g^{-1}(r) : r \in g(F)\}$$

is a countable union of sets with void interiors.

For the sufficiency, first note that any  $F_\sigma$ -set  $F$  can be written in the form  $F = \bigcup E_n$ , where  $\{E_n : n = 1, 2, \dots\}$  is a countably infinite collection of pairwise disjoint sets such that  $F_n = E_1 \cup \dots \cup E_n$  is closed for every  $n$ . Since we assume that  $F$  is a countable union of sets with void interiors, the same is true for every subset of  $F$ . In particular, for each  $n$  there is a countable collection  $\{E_{mn} : m = 1, 2, \dots\}$  of pairwise disjoint sets with void interiors such that  $E_n^\circ = \bigcup_m E_{mn}$ . The required function  $g$  is defined by

$$\begin{aligned} g(x) &= 0: & x \notin F, \\ &= 1/n: & x \in E_n \setminus E_n^\circ; \quad n = 1, 2, \dots, \\ &= 1/(n + m): & x \in E_{mn}; \quad m, n = 1, 2, \dots \end{aligned}$$

Now  $g$  is clearly continuous on  $X \setminus F$ , for if  $x \notin F$  then, for each  $n$ ,  $X \setminus F_n$  is a neighborhood of  $x$  on which  $|g| < 1/n$ .

Since  $g(F) \subset \{1/n : n = 1, 2, \dots\}$  is discrete, to show that  $g$  is discontinuous at every point of  $F$  it suffices to show that  $g$  is not constant on any open set  $V$  which meets  $F$ . Assume then that  $V$  is open and  $V \cap E_n \neq \emptyset$  for some  $n$ .

If  $V \cap E_n^\circ \neq \emptyset$ , then since each  $E_{mn}$  has void interior,  $V$  meets  $E_{mn}$  for at least two values of  $m$ , and hence  $g$  is not constant on  $V$  in this case. If  $V \cap E_n^\circ = \emptyset$ , then  $V$  contains a point  $x \in E_n \setminus E_n^\circ = E_n \cap \text{bd}(E_n)$ . Since  $V \cap (X \setminus F_{n-1})$  is a neighborhood of  $x$ , it must meet  $X \setminus E_n$ , and hence  $V$  meets  $(X \setminus F_{n-1}) \cap (X \setminus E_n) = X \setminus (F_{n-1} \cup E_n) = X \setminus F_n$ . Since  $g < 1/n$  on  $X \setminus F_n$  and  $g = 1/n$  on  $E_n \setminus E_n^\circ$ ,  $g$  is not constant on  $V$  in this case either, so the proof is complete.

COROLLARY 1. *In an arbitrary topological space  $X$ , any  $F_\sigma$ -set of the first category in  $X$  coincides with the set of points of discontinuity of some real-valued function on  $X$ .*

COROLLARY 2. *A topological space  $X$  is almost-resolvable if, and only if, there is an everywhere discontinuous function on  $X$  with countable range.*

DEFINITION. A topological space  $X$  will be called a  $DF_\sigma$ -space if every  $F_\sigma$ -subset devoid of isolated points of  $X$  coincides with the set of points of discontinuity of some real-valued function on  $X$ .

Let  $S$  denote the set of isolated points of the space  $X$ , and let  $Y = X \setminus \bar{S}$ . Then  $Y$  has no isolated points.

**THEOREM 4.** *If  $Y$  is almost-resolvable, then  $X$  is a  $DF_\sigma$ -space.*

**PROOF.** Let  $F$  be an  $F_\sigma$ -subset of  $X$  disjoint from  $S$ . Then  $F^\circ \cap S = \emptyset$ , so  $\bar{S} \subset X \setminus F^\circ$  and  $F^\circ \subset Y$ . Since an open subset of an almost-resolvable space is almost-resolvable,  $F = F^\circ \cup (F \setminus F^\circ)$  is a countable union of sets with void interiors, so the result follows from Theorem 3.

**COROLLARY 3.** *If  $Y$  is of the first category in itself, then  $X$  is a  $DF_\sigma$ -space.*

**COROLLARY 4.** *The class of  $DF_\sigma$ -spaces contains*

- (a) *any first-countable space,*
- (b) *any locally compact Hausdorff space,*
- (c) *any separable space,*
- (d) *any linear topological space.*

**PROOF.** This follows from Theorem 4 and (a)–(d) of §2, since the set  $Y$  is open and therefore inherits properties (a), (b), or (c) from  $X$ .

The author wishes to thank B. J. Pettis for several helpful conversations.

#### REFERENCES

1. H. Hahn, *Reelle Funktionen*, Akademie Verlagsgesellschaft, Leipzig, 1932; reprint, Chelsea, New York, 1948.
2. E. Hewitt, *A problem of set-theoretic topology*, *Duke Math. J.* **10** (1943), 309–333. MR **5**, 46.
3. E. Hewitt and K. Stromberg, *Real and abstract analysis. A modern treatment of the theory of functions of a real variable*, Springer-Verlag, New York, 1965. MR **32** #5826.
4. W. H. Young, *Über die Einteilung der unstetigen Funktionen und die Verteilung ihrer Stetigkeitspunkte*, S.-B. Akad. Wiss. Wien Math.-Natur. K. Abt. IIA **112** (1907), 1307–1311.

DEPARTMENT OF MATHEMATICS, UNIVERSITY OF NORTH CAROLINA AT CHAPEL HILL,  
CHAPEL HILL, NORTH CAROLINA 27514