

NO n -POINT SET IS σ -COMPACT

KHALID BOUHJAR, JAN J. DIJKSTRA, AND R. DANIEL MAULDIN

(Communicated by Alan Dow)

ABSTRACT. Let n be an integer greater than 1. We prove that there exist no F_σ -subsets of the plane that intersect every line in precisely n points.

Let $n \geq 2$ be some fixed integer. A subset of the plane \mathbb{R}^2 is called an n -point set if every line in the plane meets the set in precisely n points. The question of whether n -point sets can be Borel sets is a long standing open problem (see e.g. Mauldin [6] for details). Sierpinski [7, p. 447] has given a simple example of a closed set that meets every line in \aleph_0 points. It was shown by Baston and Bostock [1] and by Bouhjar, Dijkstra, and van Mill [2] that 2-point sets, respectively 3-point sets, cannot be F_σ in the plane. Both papers use a method suggested by Larman [5] for the case $n = 2$ which consists of proving on the one hand that 2-point sets cannot contain arcs and on the other hand that 2-point sets that are F_σ must contain arcs. Observe that to prove the result that is the subject of this note Larman's program cannot be followed because it was shown in [2] that n -point sets can contain arcs whenever $n \geq 4$.

Theorem. *Let $n \geq 2$. No n -point set is an F_σ -subset of the plane.*

The three authors of this note each, independently of each other, found a proof for this theorem. We decided to publish the shortest proof jointly.

Proof. Assume that A is an n -point set that is an F_σ -subset of the plane. Let xy be an arbitrary rectangular coordinate system for the plane and let λ be the Lebesgue measure on \mathbb{R} . According to [2, Proposition 3.2] there exists a nondegenerate interval $[a, b]$ on the x -axis and continuous functions $f_1 < f_2 < \dots < f_n$ from $[a, b]$ into \mathbb{R} such that A contains the graph of each f_i . Consider an f_i and its graph G_i . Since A is an n -point set each horizontal line intersects G_i in at most n points. So every fibre of f_i has cardinality at most n . Consequently, according to Banach [4, Exercise 17.34], the variation of f_i is bounded by $n(M - m)$, where m and M are the minimum and maximum values of f_i . According to Lebesgue [4, Theorem 17.17] the derivative of a function of bounded variation such as f_i exists almost everywhere. Select a Borel set $B \subset [a, b]$ such that $\lambda(B) = b - a$ and every f_i is differentiable at every point of B . By the Whitney Extension Theorem for C^1 functions [3, Theorem 3.1.16] there exists a set $C \subset B$ such that $\lambda(C) > 0$ and

Received by the editors November 30, 1999 and, in revised form, January 7, 2000.

2000 *Mathematics Subject Classification.* Primary 54H05, 57N05, 54G99.

The second author was supported in part by a grant from the Research Advisory Committee of the University of Alabama.

The third author was supported in part by NSF grant DMS-9801583.

continuously differentiable functions $g_i : [a, b] \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$ with $g_i|_C = f_i|_C$ for $1 \leq i \leq n$. The functions g_i satisfy the premises of Theorem 7 in [6] so we may conclude that the set A is bounded or intersects some line in $n + 1$ points. Either way, the result is inconsistent with A being an n -point set. \square

REFERENCES

- [1] V. J. Baston and F. A. Bostock, *On a theorem of Larman*, J. London Math. Soc. (2) **5** (1972), 715–718. MR **47**:4138
- [2] K. Bouhjar, J. J. Dijkstra, and J. van Mill, *Three-point sets*, Topology Appl., to appear.
- [3] H. Federer, *Geometric Measure Theory*, Springer Verlag, New York, 1969. MR **41**:1976
- [4] E. Hewitt and K. Stromberg, *Real and Abstract Analysis*, Springer Verlag, New York, 1965. MR **32**:5826
- [5] D. G. Larman, *A problem of incidence*, J. London Math. Soc. **43** (1968), 407–409. MR **38**:52
- [6] R. D. Mauldin, *On sets which meet each line in exactly two points*, Bull. London Math. Soc. **30** (1998), 397–403. MR **99f**:28010
- [7] W. Sierpiński, *Cardinal and Ordinal Numbers*, PWN, Warsaw, 1958. MR **20**:2288

FACULTY OF SCIENCES, DIVISION OF MATHEMATICS AND COMPUTER SCIENCE, VRIJE UNIVERSITEIT, DE BOELELAAN 1081 A, 1081 HV AMSTERDAM, THE NETHERLANDS
E-mail address: kbouhjar@cs.vu.nl

DEPARTMENT OF MATHEMATICS, THE UNIVERSITY OF ALABAMA, BOX 870350, TUSCALOOSA, ALABAMA 35487-0350
E-mail address: jdijkstr@obelix.math.ua.edu

DEPARTMENT OF MATHEMATICS, UNIVERSITY OF NORTH TEXAS, DENTON, TEXAS 76203
E-mail address: mauldin@dynamics.math.unt.edu