

I would like to thank Max Lipton and Xinrui Zhao for providing a simple solution to Exercise 3.32(ii), please see the file Lipton-Zhao-exercise-3-32.pdf.

Another example can be obtained by modifying the function in Theorem 1.15 in the second edition.

**Theorem 1** *Let  $v(x) = |x|$  for  $x \in [-1, 1]$  and extend  $v$  to  $\mathbb{R}$  as a periodic function of period 2. Then the function*

$$u(x) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{4^{n/p}} v(4^n x), \quad x \in \mathbb{R},$$

*has finite  $p$ -variation but it is not  $p$ -absolutely continuous.*

We recall that if  $1 < p < \infty$ , then  $AC_p([a, b])$  is given by all functions  $v : [a, b] \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  such that for every  $\varepsilon > 0$  there exists  $\delta > 0$  such that

$$\left( \sum_{i=1}^n |v(b_i) - v(a_i)|^p \right)^{1/p} \leq \varepsilon$$

for every finite number of nonoverlapping intervals  $(a_i, b_i)$ ,  $i = 1, \dots, n$ , with  $[a_i, b_i] \subseteq I$  and

$$\left( \sum_{i=1}^n (b_i - a_i)^p \right)^{1/p} \leq \delta.$$

**Proof.** To prove that  $u \notin AC_p([0, 1])$ , take  $x \in [0, 1]$  and  $h_m = \pm \frac{1}{2} \frac{1}{4^m}$ , where the sign is chosen in such a way that in the open interval of endpoints  $4^m x$  and  $4^m(x + h_m)$  there is no integer. Then as in the proof of Theorem 1.15, we have that

$$\begin{aligned} v_n(x + h_m) - v_n(x) &= \frac{1}{4^{n/p}} v(4^n(x + h_m)) - \frac{1}{4^{n/p}} v(4^n x) \\ &= \frac{1}{4^{n/p}} [v(4^n x \pm \frac{1}{2} 4^{n-m}) - v(4^n x)]. \end{aligned}$$

If  $n > m$ , then by periodicity the right-hand side is zero. If  $n = m$ , then

$$|v_m(x + h_m) - v_m(x)| = \frac{1}{4^{m/p}} 4^m |h_m| = \frac{1}{4^{m/p}} \frac{1}{2}.$$

Finally, if  $n < m$ , then using the fact that  $v$  is Lipschitz continuous with Lipschitz constant 1 we get

$$|v_n(x + h_m) - v_n(x)| \leq \frac{1}{4^{n/p}} 4^n |h_m| = \frac{1}{2} \frac{1}{4^{m-n+n/p}}.$$

Hence,

$$u(x + h_m) - u(x) = \sum_{n=1}^m (v_n(x + h_m) - v_n(x))$$

and using the inequality  $|a + b| \geq |b| - |a|$ , we get

$$\begin{aligned}
|u(x + h_m) - u(x)| &= \left| v_m(x + h_m) - v_m(x) + \sum_{n=1}^{m-1} (v_n(x + h_m) - v_n(x)) \right| \\
&\geq |v_m(x + h_m) - v_m(x)| - \sum_{n=1}^{m-1} |v_m(x + h_m) - v_m(x)| \\
&\geq \frac{1}{4^{m/p}} \frac{1}{2} - \frac{1}{2} \sum_{n=1}^{m-1} \frac{1}{4^{m-n+n/p}} = \frac{1}{4^{m/p}} \frac{1}{2} - \frac{1}{2} \frac{1}{4^m} \sum_{n=1}^{m-1} 4^{n-n/p} \\
&= \frac{1}{4^{m/p}} \frac{1}{2} \left( 1 - \frac{1}{4^{1-1/p-1}} \right) + \frac{1}{2} \frac{1}{4^m} \frac{4}{4-4^{1/p}} \\
&\geq \frac{1}{4^{m/p}} \frac{1}{2} \left( 1 - \frac{1}{4^{1-1/p-1}} \right) = c|h_m|^{1/p}.
\end{aligned} \tag{1}$$

Take  $\ell = 4^m$ ,  $x = a_i = \frac{i}{4^m}$ ,  $i = 0, \dots, 4^m - 1$ , and  $h_m = \frac{1}{2} \frac{1}{4^m}$  and observe that in the open interval of endpoints  $4^m a_i = i$  and  $4^m(a_i + h_m) = 4^m(\frac{i}{4^m} + \frac{1}{2} \frac{1}{4^m}) = i + \frac{1}{2}$  there is no integer. Moreover,

$$b_i := a_i + h_m, i = \frac{i}{4^m} + \frac{1}{2} \frac{1}{4^m} < \frac{i+1}{4^m} = a_{i+1}.$$

Hence, the intervals  $(a_i, b_i)$  are pairwise disjoint. Using (1),

$$\sum_{i=1}^{4^m-1} |u(b_i) - u(a_i)|^p \geq c \sum_{i=1}^{4^m-1} |b_i - a_i| = c 4^{m-1} |h_m| = \frac{c}{2} \frac{4^m - 1}{4^m} \rightarrow \frac{c}{2} > 0,$$

while

$$\sum_{i=1}^{4^m-1} |b_i - a_i|^p = \frac{1}{2^p} \frac{4^m - 1}{4^{mp}} \rightarrow 0 \quad \text{as } m \rightarrow \infty.$$

This shows that  $u \notin AC_p([0, 1])$ .

To see that  $u$  has finite  $p$ -variation, let's prove that it is Hölder continuous of exponent  $1/p$ . Given,  $0 \leq x < y \leq 1$ , let  $m = \lfloor \log_4[1/(y-x)] \rfloor$ . Since  $v$  is Lipschitz continuous with Lipschitz constant 1, we can write

$$\begin{aligned}
|u(x) - u(y)| &\leq \sum_{n=1}^m \frac{1}{4^{n/p}} |v(4^n x) - v(4^n y)| + 2 \sum_{n=m+1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{4^{n/p}} \\
&\leq \sum_{n=1}^m 4^{n(1-1/p)} (y-x) + 2 \sum_{n=m+1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{4^{n/p}} \\
&\leq C 4^{m(1-1/p)} (y-x) + C 4^{-m/p} \\
&\leq C (y-x)^{1/p}
\end{aligned}$$

where we used the fact that  $4^m \leq 1/(y-x) < 4^{m+1}$ . In turn, for any partition  $0 = x_0 < \dots < x_\ell = 1$ ,

$$\sum_{i=1}^{\ell} |u(x_i) - u(x_{i-1})|^p \leq C^p \sum_{i=1}^{\ell} (x_i - x_{i-1}) = C^p,$$

and so  $\text{Var}_p u \leq C$ . ■