TRANSACTIONS OF THE
AMERICAN MATHEMATICAL SOCIETY
Volume 192, 1974

A DIVERGENT WEIGHTED ORTHONORMAL SERIES OF BROKEN LINE FRANKLIN FUNCTIONS

BY
COKE S. REED

ABSTRACT. The purpose of this paper is to define a differentiable function F and an inner product on the space of continuous functions on [0,1] in such a way that the Fourier expansion of F obtained by orthonormalizing the broken line Franklin functions according to this inner product is divergent.

I. **Introduction.** Let $z_1, z_2, \ldots$ denote a reversible number sequence such that $\{z_i\}$ is a subset of [0,1] and is dense in [0,1]. Define $\theta_0, \theta_1, \theta_2, \ldots$ to be the sequence of functions on [0,1] such that $\theta_0(x) = 1$, and for each positive integer i, $\theta_i(x) = 0$ if $0 \leq x \leq z_i$, and $\theta_i(x) = x - z_i$ if $z_i \leq x \leq 1$. Let W denote a continuous strictly increasing function on [0,1]. Define the inner product $((f,g))_W$ of two continuous functions f and g with domain [0,1] to be $\int_0^1 f \cdot g\,dW$. Since no member of the sequence $\theta_0, \theta_1, \theta_2, \ldots$ is a finite linear combination of the other members of the sequence, we can use the Gram-Schmidt process to construct a sequence $\phi_0, \phi_1, \phi_2, \ldots$ of functions on [0,1] such that for each positive integer k, ϕ_k is a linear combination of $\theta_0, \theta_1, \theta_2, \ldots, \theta_k$ and θ_k is a linear combination of $\phi_0, \phi_1, \ldots, \phi_k$ and such that $\phi_0, \phi_1, \phi_2, \ldots$ is orthonormal relative to $((\ ,\ ))_W$. The sequence $\phi_0, \phi_1, \ldots$ will be referred to as the (z,W) sequence. Let I denote the function such that $I(x) = x$.

Franklin [1] showed that if f is a continuous function with domain [0,1], and $z_1, z_2, \ldots$ satisfies a certain property and $\phi_0, \phi_1, \ldots$ is the (z,I) sequence, then the sequence of functions $s_n = \sum_{i=0}^n ((f,\phi_i)) \cdot \phi_i$ converges uniformly to f as n tends to infinity. Wall [3] used (z,W) sequences for arbitrary z and W in the study of certain moment problems and raised the following question to his students. Is it true that if F is a continuous function defined on [0,1] and $z_1, z_2, \ldots$ is a reversible number sequence such that $\{z_i\}$ is a subset of [0,1] and is dense in [0,1] and W is a continuous and strictly increasing function defined on [0,1], then $\sum_{i=0}^n ((f,\phi_i))_W \cdot \phi_i$ converges uniformly to f as n tends to infinity? Sox [2] showed that for every such sequence z, the (z,I) Fourier expansion of a continuous function f converges uniformly to f. It is the purpose of this paper to exhibit a z, W, and F so that if $\phi_0, \phi_1, \phi_2, \ldots$ is the (z,W) sequence, then $\sum_{i=0}^n ((F,\phi_i))\phi_i$ is divergent.

Presented to the Society, November 25, 1972; received by the editors December 5, 1972 and, in revised form, March 29, 1973.

AMS (MOS) subject classifications (1970). Primary 42A56, 42A60.

Key words and phrases. Franklin functions, Fourier series, weighted orthonormal series, broken line functions.

II. **The example.** There exists a z sequence, a differentiable function F defined on [0,1] and a strictly increasing infinitely differentiable function W defined on [0,1] such that if $\phi_0, \phi_1, \phi_2, \ldots$ is the (z, W) sequence, then the number sequence $\sum_{i=0}^{n} ((\phi_i, F)) \cdot \phi_i(1)$ is unbounded.

Let $(z_1, z_2, \ldots)$ denote the sequence $(0, 1/2, 1/4, 3/4, 1/8, 3/8, 5/8, 7/8, 1/16, \ldots)$; let K denote the set $\{1/2, 1/4, 1/8, \ldots\}$ and let h denote the function defined by $h(x) = (1-x)^2$. Two sequences $(f_1, f_2, \ldots)$ and $(w_1, w_2, \ldots)$ of functions will now be defined inductively so that the desired functions F and W of the example can be defined by the formulas $F = \sum_{i=1}^{\infty} f_i$ and $W = \sum_{i=1}^{\infty} w_i$. In order to facilitate this construction, fourteen additional sequences, $(N_1, N_2, \ldots)$, $(M_1, M_2, \ldots)$, $(t_1, t_2, \ldots)$, $(g_1, g_2, \ldots)$, $(R_1, R_2, \ldots)$, $(\alpha_1, \alpha_2, \ldots)$, $(\beta_1, \beta_2, \ldots)$, $(\lambda_1, \lambda_2, \ldots)$, $(V_1, V_2, \ldots)$, $(d_1, d_2, \ldots)$, $(s_1, s_2, \ldots)$, $(u_1, u_2, \ldots)$, $(c_1, c_2, \ldots)$ and $(P_1, P_2, \ldots)$, will be defined inductively along with the sequences $(f_1, f_2, \ldots)$ and $(w_1, w_2, \ldots)$.

Set $M_1 = 1/2$ and set $N_1 = 1/2$. Let t_1 denote a member of K such that $t_1 < M_1/4$ and such that the function g_1 defined by the following formulas lies below h.

$$\begin{aligned} g_1(x) &= 0, && \text{if } 0 \le x \le N_1, \\ &= 4x/M_1 - 4N_1/M_1, && \text{if } N_1 \le x \le N_1 + t_1, \\ &= -4x/M_1 + 4(N_1 + 2t_1)/M_1, && \text{if } N_1 + t_1 \le x \le N_1 + 2t_1, \\ &= 0, && \text{if } N_1 + 2t_1 < x \le 1. \end{aligned}$$

Notice that g_1 is continuous. Let f_1 denote a differentiable function such that if $x \in [0,1]$; then $0 \le f_1(x) \le h(x)$ and if $x \in [0,1] - ([N_1 - t_1/4, N_1 + t_1/4] \cup [N_1 + 3t_1/4, N_1 + 5t_1/4] \cup [N_1 + 7t_1/4, N_1 + 9t_1/4])$, then $f_1(x) = g_1(x)$. Let R_1 denote the class of all straight lines γ with the property that $\gamma(1) < 1$. Set $\alpha_1 = N_1 + t_1/3$, set $\beta_1 = N_1 + 2t_1/3$ and set $\lambda_1 = N_1 + 3t_1$. Let V_1 denote the number set to which the number d belongs if and only if there exists a member γ of R_1 with the property that $d = \int_{\alpha_1}^{\beta_1} [\gamma(x) - f_1(x)]^2 \, dx$. Let δ denote a straight line such that $1 < \delta(1) < 2$ and such that δ intersects f_1 at a point (a, b) where $\alpha_1 < a < \beta_1$. If γ is in R_1, then either $\int_{\alpha_1}^{a} [\gamma(x) - \delta(x)]^2 \, dx < \int_{\alpha_1}^{a} [\gamma(x) - f_1(x)]^2 \, dx$ or else $\int_{a}^{\beta_1} [\gamma(x) - \delta(x)]^2 \, dx < \int_{a}^{\beta_1} [\gamma(x) - f_1(x)]^2 \, dx$. Therefore, the greatest lower bound of V_1 is positive. Let d_1 denote a positive number less than one and less than the greatest lower bound of V_1. Set $s_1 = 1$. Let u_1 denote a function defined on [0,1] with the following seven properties:

(1) u_1 is infinitely differentiable over [0,1].

(2) $u_1(0) = 0$.

(3) u_1 is strictly increasing over $[0, \lambda_1]$.

(4) If x and y are in $[\lambda_1, 1]$, then $u_1(x) = u_1(y)$.

(5) The restriction of u_1 to $[\alpha_1, \beta_1]$ is a straight line with slope s_1.

(6) If $x \in [0,1]$, then $u_1'(x) \le s_1$.

(7) $[u_1(\alpha_1) - u_1(0)] + [u_1(1) - u_1(\beta_1)] < s_1 \cdot d_1/4$.

There is a positive number $c_1 < 1$ such that for each number x in [0,1], $|c_1 \cdot u_1'(x)| < 1/2$. Let $w_1 = c_1 \cdot u_1$.

Continue this construction inductively for each integer $j > 1$ as follows. Let M_j denote a member of K satisfying the inequalities $\lambda_{j-1} < 1 - 3M_j$ and $M_j < t_{j-1}$. Let $N_j = 1 - M_j$. There is an integer k such that $z_k = N_j$. There exists a $k + 1$ term number sequence $a_0, a_1, \ldots, a_k$ such that if $b_0, b_1, \ldots, b_k$ is a $k + 1$ term number sequence, then

$$\int_0^{\lambda_{j-1}} \left(\sum_{n=1}^{j-1} f_n - \sum_{n=0}^{k} a_n \phi_n\right)^2 d \sum_{n=1}^{j-1} w_n$$
$$\leq \int_0^{\lambda_{j-1}} \left(\sum_{n=1}^{j-1} f_n - \sum_{n=0}^{k} b_n \phi_n\right)^2 d \sum_{n=1}^{j-1} w_n .$$

Let $P_{j-1} = \sum_{n=0}^{k} a_n \phi_n$. Let t_j denote a member of K such that $t_j < M_j/4$ and such that the function g_j, defined by the following formulas, lies below h.

$$\begin{aligned} g_j(x) &= 0, && \text{if } 0 \leq x \leq N_j, \\ &= 4jx/M_j - 4jN_j/M_j, && \text{if } N_j \leq x \leq N_j + t_j, \\ &= -4jx/M_j + 4j(N_j + 2t_j)/M_j, && \text{if } N_j + t_j \leq x \leq N_j + 2t_j, \\ &= 0, && \text{if } N_j + 2t_j < x \leq 1. \end{aligned}$$

Notice that g_j is continuous. Let f_j denote a differentiable function such that if $x \in [0,1]$, then $0 \leq f_j(x) \leq h(x)$ and if $x \in [0,1] - \{[N_j - t_j/4, N_j + t_j/4] \cup [N_j + 3t_j/4, N_j + 5t_j/4] \cup [N_j + 7t_j/4, N_j + 9t_j/4]\}$, then $f_j(x) = g_j(x)$. Let R_j denote the class of all straight lines γ with the property that $\gamma(1) < j$. Set $\alpha_j = N_j + t_j/3$, set $\beta_j = N_j + 2t_j/3$, and set $\lambda_j = N_j + 3t_j$. Let V_j denote the number set to which the number d belongs if and only if there exists a member γ of R_j with the property that $d = \int_{\beta_j}^{\alpha_j} (\gamma(x) - f_j(x))^2 dx$. As with V_1, the greatest lower bound of V_j is positive. Let d_j denote a positive number less than d_{j-1} and less than the greatest lower bound of V_j. Set $s_j = c_{j-1} \cdot s_{j-1} \cdot d_{j-1}/(64j^2)$.

Let u_j denote a function defined on [0,1] with the following eight properties:

(1) u_j is infinitely differentiable over [0,1].

(2) If $x \in [0, \lambda_{j-1}]$, then $u_j(x) = 0$.

(3) u_j is strictly increasing on $[\lambda_{j-1}, \lambda_j]$.

(4) If x and y are in $[\lambda_j, 1]$, then $u_j(x) = u_j(y)$.

(5) The restriction of u_j to $[\alpha_j, \beta_j]$ is a straight line with slope s_j.

(6) If $x \in [0,1]$, then $u_j'(x) \leq s_j$.

(7) $[u_j(\alpha_j) - u_j(0)] + [u_j(1) - u_j(\beta_j)] < s_j \cdot d_j/(64j^2)$.

(8) $u_j(\lambda_{j-1} + M_j) < s_j \cdot d_j/(32j^2(|P_{j-1}(\lambda_{j-1})| + 1)^2)$.

There is a positive number $c_j < 1$ such that for each x in [0,1] and each positive integer $k \leq j$, $|c_j \cdot u_j^{(k)}(x)| < 1/2^j$ where $u_j^{(k)}$ is the kth derivative of u_j. Let $w_j = c_j \cdot u_j$.

Notice that if x is a number in $[0,1)$ and there exists a positive integer i such that $f_i(x) \neq 0$, then there is an open set S containing x such that if j is a positive integer distinct from i and ψ is in S, then $f_j(\psi) = 0$. It follows from this fact that the function $F = \sum_{i=1}^{\infty} f_i$ exists and is differentiable at each number x in $[0,1)$. But for each $x \in [0,1]$, we have that $0 \leq F(x) \leq h(x)$ and therefore F is differentiable at 1.

If m is a positive integer, and j is an integer greater than m, and x is a number in $[1 - 2M_j, 1]$, then $|W^{(m)}(x)| < 1/2^j$. Notice that this fact implies that W and all of its derivatives exist on $[0,1]$ and $W^{(m)}(1) = 0$.

Suppose that there exists an integer $j > 1$ such that if k is the integer with the property that $z_k = N_j$, then $\sum_{i=0}^{k} ((\phi_i, F))_W \phi_i(1) < j$. Let $G = \sum_{i=0}^{k} ((\phi_i, F))_W \phi_i$. G has the property that if $a_0, a_1, \ldots, a_k$ is a $k+1$ term number sequence, then

$$\int_0^1 (F-G)^2 dW \leq \int_0^1 \left(F - \sum_{i=0}^{k} a_i \phi_i\right)^2 dW.$$

Since $\lambda_{j-1} < N_j < \alpha_j < \beta_j$, we have that

$$\int_0^1 (F-G)^2 dW \geq \int_0^{\lambda_{j-1}} (F-G)^2 dW + \int_{\alpha_j}^{\beta_j} (F-G)^2 dW.$$

But the restriction of F to $[\alpha_j, \beta_j]$ is a subset of f_j and the restriction of G to $[\alpha_j, \beta_j]$ lies on a straight line γ such that $\gamma(1) < j$. Therefore, we have that $\int_{\alpha_j}^{\beta_j} (F-G)^2 dW = \int_{\alpha_j}^{\beta_j} (f_j - \gamma)^2 dW$. But the restriction of W to $[\alpha_j, \beta_j]$ lies on a straight line with slope $c_j \cdot s_j$ and therefore

$$\int_{\beta_j}^{\alpha_j} (f_j - \gamma)^2 dW = c_j \cdot s_j \cdot \int_{\alpha_j}^{\beta_j} (f_j - \gamma)^2 (x)\, dx.$$

Since γ is in R_j, $\int_{\beta_j}^{\alpha_j} (f_j - \gamma)^2(x)\, dx > d_j$. Combining these inequalities gives the inequality

$$\int_0^1 (F-G)^2 dW > \int_0^{\lambda_{j-1}} (F-G)^2 dW + c_j \cdot s_j \cdot d_j.$$

Let H denote the function with the following four properties:

(1) The restriction of H to $[0, \lambda_{j-1}]$ is P_{j-1}.

(2) The restriction of H to $[\lambda_{j-1}, \lambda_{j-1} + M_j]$ lies on the straight line containing $(\lambda_{j-1}, P_{j-1}(\lambda_{j-1}))$ and $(\lambda_{j-1} + M_j, 0)$.

(3) If $x \in [\lambda_{j-1} + M_j, N_j]$, then $H(x) = 0$.

(4) The restriction of H to $[N_j, 1]$ is a straight line such that if $x \in [\alpha_j, \beta_j]$, then $H(x) = F(x)$.

There is a $k+1$ term number sequence $a_0, a_1, \ldots, a_k$ such that $H(x) = a_0\phi_0 + a_1\phi_1 + \cdots + a_k\phi_k$, and therefore,

$$\text{(A)} \qquad \begin{aligned} \int_0^1 (F-H)^2 dW &\geq \int_0^1 (F-G)^2 dW \\ &> \int_0^{\lambda_{j-1}} (F-G)^2 dW + c_j \cdot s_j \cdot d_j. \end{aligned}$$

Notice that

$$\text{(B)}\qquad \begin{aligned}\int_0^1 (F-H)^2 dW = \int_0^{\lambda_{j-1}} (F-H)^2 dW + \int_{\lambda_{j-1}}^{\lambda_{j-1}+M_j} (F-H)^2 dW \\ + \int_{\lambda_{j-1}+M_j}^{\alpha_j} (F-H)^2 dW + \int_{\alpha_j}^{\beta_j} (F-H)^2 dW \\ + \int_{\beta_j}^1 (F-H)^2 dW.\end{aligned}$$

For each $x \in [0, \lambda_{j-1}]$, $F(x) = \sum_{i=1}^{j-1} f_i(x)$ and $H(x) = P_{j-1}(x)$. Therefore, from the definition of P, we obtain:

$$\text{(C)}\qquad \begin{aligned}\int_0^{\lambda_{j-1}} (F-H)^2 dW = \int_0^{\lambda_{j-1}} \left(\left(\sum_{i=1}^{j-1} f_i\right) - P_{j-1}\right)^2 dW \\ \leq \int_0^{\lambda_{j-1}} (F-G)^2 dW.\end{aligned}$$

For each $x \in [\lambda_{j-1}, \lambda_{j-1} + M_j]$, $F(x) = 0$ and $|H(x)| \leq |P_{j-1}(\lambda_{j-1})|$. Moreover,

$$W(\lambda_{ij} + M_j) - W(\lambda_{j-1}) = w_j(\lambda_{j-1} + M_j) - w_j(\lambda_{j-1}) < \frac{c_j \cdot s_j \cdot d_j}{4j(|P_{j-1}(\lambda_{j-1})| + 1)^2}.$$

Therefore, we have that

$$\text{(D)}\qquad \begin{aligned}\int_{\lambda_{j-1}}^{\lambda_{j-1}+M_j} (F-H)^2 dW \leq \frac{(P_{j-1}(\lambda_{j-1}))^2 \cdot c_j \cdot s_j \cdot d_j}{(4j(P_{j-1}(\lambda_{j-1}) + 1)^2)} \\ < \frac{c_j \cdot s_j \cdot d_j}{4}.\end{aligned}$$

For each $x \in [\lambda_{j-1} + M_j, \alpha_j]$, $(F-H)^2(x) < 1$. Moreover, $W(\alpha_j) - W(\lambda_{j-1} + M_j) = w_j(\alpha_j) - w_j(\lambda_{j-1} + M_j) < c_j \cdot s_j \cdot d_j/4$. There inequalities imply

$$\text{(E)}\qquad \int_{\lambda_{j-1}+M_j}^{\alpha_j} (F-H)^2 dW < c_j \cdot s_j \cdot d_j/4.$$

For each $x \in [\alpha_j, \beta_j]$, $F(x) = H(x)$ and therefore,

$$\text{(F)}\qquad \int_{\alpha_j}^{\beta_j} (F-H)^2 dW = 0.$$

For each $x \in [\beta_j, 1]$, $(F-H)^2(x) < 16j^2$. Moreover,

$$\begin{aligned}W(1) - W(\beta_j) &= w_j(1) - w_j(\beta_j) + w_{j+1}(1) - w_{j+1}(\beta_j) + w_{j+2}(1) - w_{j+2}(\beta_j) + \cdots \\ &< c_j s_j d_j/(64j^2) + c_{j+1} s_{j+1} \cdot (\lambda_{j+1} - \lambda_j) + c_{j+2} s_{j+2} \cdot (\lambda_{j+2} - \lambda_{j+1}) + \cdots \\ &< c_j s_j d_j/(32j^2).\end{aligned}$$

Therefore, we have the inequality

$$\text{(G)}\qquad \int_{\beta_j}^1 (F-H)^2 dW < (16j^2)(s_j d_j c_j/(32j^2)) < c_j s_j d_j/2.$$

Combining inequalities (B), (C), (D), (E), (F), and (G) yields

$$\int_0^1 (F-H)^2\,dW < \int_0^{\lambda_{j-1}} (F-G)^2\,dW + c_j s_j d_j$$

which contradicts inequality (A) and therefore the proof is completed.

This example gives rise to a number of questions:

(1) Characterize those strictly increasing continuous functions w which have the property that if f is a continuous function on 0,1 and $z_1, z_2, \ldots$ is a z sequence, then the (z,w) Fourier expansion of f converges uniformly to f.

(2) By a slight modification of the example in this paper, one can construct a z, f, and w such that the (z,w) Fourier expansion of f converges pointwise to f but not uniformly to f. However, the following question remains unanswered: Is there a (z,w) system such that if f is a continuous function on [0,1] then the (z,w) Fourier expansion of f converges pointwise to f, but there exists a continuous g on [0,1] such that the (z,w) Fourier expansion of g does not converge uniformly to g?

(3) Is there a strictly increasing continuous w such that there exist sequences z and z' such that if f is continuous on [0,1] then the (z,w) Fourier expansion of f converges uniformly to f, but there exists a continuous function g on [0,1] such that the (z',w) Fourier expansion of g does not converge to g?

(4) Is the following statement a theorem: If w is a strictly increasing continuously differentiable function on [0,1] and $z_1, z_2, \ldots$ is a z sequence in [0,1] and f is continuously differentiable on [0,1], then the (z,w) Fourier expansion of f converges uniformly to f over [0,1].

References

1. Philip Franklin, *A set of continuous orthogonal functions*, Math. Ann. **100** (1928), 522–529.

2. J. L. Sox, Jr., *A class of complete orthogonal sequences of broken line functions*, Trans. Amer. Math. Soc. **166** (1972), 293–296. MR **45** #811.

3. H. S. Wall, *Creative mathematics*, Univ. of Texas Press, Austin, Tex., 1963, pp. 161–168.

Department of Mathematics, Auburn University, Auburn, Alabama 36830