CONTEMPORARY MATHEMATICS

795

Mathematical Analyses of Decisions, Voting and Games

AMS Special Session
Mathematics of Decisions, Elections and Games
April 8, 2022
Virtual

Michael A. Jones
David McCune
Jennifer M. Wilson
Editors

AMS American Mathematical Society

Mathematical Analyses of Decisions, Voting and Games

CONTEMPORARY MATHEMATICS

795

Mathematical Analyses of Decisions, Voting and Games

AMS Special Session
Mathematics of Decisions, Elections and Games
April 8, 2022
Virtual

Michael A. Jones
David McCune
Jennifer M. Wilson
Editors

AMS American Mathematical Society

EDITORIAL COMMITTEE

Michael Loss, Chair

John Etnyre Angela Gibney Alex Kontorovich

2020 *Mathematics Subject Classification.* Primary 91-06, 90B06, 91A05, 91A18, 91A46, 91B06, 91B12, 91B14, 91B32.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: AMS Special Session on Mathematics of Decisions, Elections and Games (2022 : Online), author. | Jones, Michael A., 1967- editor. | McCune, David, 1984- editor. | Wilson, Jennifer Mia, 1965- editor.

Title: Mathematical analyses of decisions, voting and games : Virtual AMS Special Session on Mathematics of Decisions, Elections and Games, April 8, 2022 / Michael A. Jones, David McCune, Jennifer M. Wilson, editors.

Description: Providence, Rhode Island : American Mathematical Society, 2024. | Series: Contemporary mathematics, 0271-4132 ; 795 | Includes bibliographical references.

Identifiers: LCCN 2023042077 | ISBN 9781470469788 (paperback) | 9781470476083 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Decision making–Mathematical models–Congresses. | Voting–Mathematical models–Congresses. | Game theory–Congresses. | AMS: Game theory, economics, social and behavioral sciences – Proceedings, conferences, collections, etc.. | Operations research, mathematical programming – Operations research and management science – Transportation, logistics. | Game theory, economics, social and behavioral sciences – Game theory – 2-person games. | Game theory, economics, social and behavioral sciences – Game theory – Games in extensive form. | Game theory, economics, social and behavioral sciences – Game theory – Combinatorial games. | Game theory, economics, social and behavioral sciences – Mathematical economics – Decision theory. | Game theory, economics, social and behavioral sciences – Mathematical economics – Voting theory. | Game theory, economics, social and behavioral sciences – Mathematical economics – Social choice. | Game theory, economics, social and behavioral sciences – Mathematical economics – Resource and cost allocation.

Classification: LCC QA279.4 .A64 2022 | DDC 519.3–dc23/eng/20240105

LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2023042077

Color graphic policy. Any graphics created in color will be rendered in grayscale for the printed version unless color printing is authorized by the Publisher. In general, color graphics will appear in color in the online version.

Copying and reprinting. Individual readers of this publication, and nonprofit libraries acting for them, are permitted to make fair use of the material, such as to copy select pages for use in teaching or research. Permission is granted to quote brief passages from this publication in reviews, provided the customary acknowledgment of the source is given.

Republication, systematic copying, or multiple reproduction of any material in this publication is permitted only under license from the American Mathematical Society. Requests for permission to reuse portions of AMS publication content are handled by the Copyright Clearance Center. For more information, please visit `www.ams.org/publications/pubpermissions`.

Send requests for translation rights and licensed reprints to `reprint-permission@ams.org`.

© 2024 by the American Mathematical Society. All rights reserved.
The American Mathematical Society retains all rights
except those granted to the United States Government.
Printed in the United States of America.

⊗ The paper used in this book is acid-free and falls within the guidelines
established to ensure permanence and durability.
Visit the AMS home page at `https://www.ams.org/`

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1 29 28 27 26 25 24

Contents

Preface vii

When to stop consulting
D. Marc Kilgour and Steven J. Brams 1

How lies induced cooperation in *Golden Balls*: A game-theoretic analysis
Steven J. Brams and Ben D. Mor 15

Conditions for fairness anomalies in instant-runoff voting
Adam Graham-Squire 23

Piercing numbers in circular societies
Kristen Mazur, Mutiara Sondjaja, Matthew Wright, and Carolyn Yarnall 37

Voting on cyclic orders, group theory, and ballots
Karl-Dieter Crisman, Abraham Holleran, Micah Martin, and Josephine Noonan 57

Impossibility theorems involving weakenings of expansion consistency and resoluteness in voting
Wesley H. Holliday, Chase Norman, Eric Pacuit, and Saam Zahedian 87

Connecting Arrow's Theorem, voting theory, and the Traveling Salesperson Problem
Donald G. Saari 137

An iterative procedure for apportionment and its use in the 2016 Georgia Republican Primary
Michael A. Jones, David McCune, and Jennifer Wilson 153

Double moves by each player in chess openings make the game fairer
Steven J. Brams and Mehmet S. Ismail 189

Preface

The papers included in this volume are based on talks given at the AMS Special Sections on the Mathematics of Decisions, Elections, and Games at the 2022 Joint Mathematics Meetings. The session was co-organized by Michael A. Jones (Mathematical Reviews), David McCune (William Jewell College), and Jennifer M. Wilson (The New School). Decision theory, voting theory and game theory are three intertwined areas in the mathematical social sciences that involve making optimal decisions in different contexts.

Decision theory studies instances in which individuals make choices, often under uncertainty, while game theory analyzes optimal decisions when outcomes are affected by all the players' actions. Voting theory and its application to elections, considers the outcomes when individual decisions on submitting ballots for candidates are aggregated to determine a social choice. These areas share a characteristic diversity of mathematical techniques encompassing both continuous and discrete analysis, algebraic and graph theoretic approaches, and probabilistic and deterministic reasoning. The papers in this collection span this diversity. We describe the papers below.

When to stop consulting, by Kilgour and Brams, analyzes optimal strategies for a decision maker who must make a binary choice but has the option to consult experts a fixed number of times. Similar to the Secretary Problem, in which an individual must select a job candidate after a sequence of interviews, the Consultation Problem concerns a situation when a sequence of interactions should terminate a process and trigger a decision. The decision maker's decision to either stop or to consult results in a Bayesian decision binary tree in which optimizing the expected utility depends on the cost of the consultation.

Connecting Arrow's theorem, voting theory, and the Traveling Salesperson Problem, by Saari, shows how the analysis of pairwise voting methods and the traveling salesperson problem can be unified and simplified by treating the corresponding weighted graph as a vector space and decomposing it into portions that contain cycles and those that do not. Saari shows that finding a winner from a given profile reduces to analyzing the non-cyclic component of the graph while finding an optimal solution for the traveling salesperson problem can be simplified by analyzing the graph's cyclic component.

Graph theory is also used in *Piercing numbers in circular societies*, by Mazur, Sondjaja, Wright, and Yarnall. In their work, the authors extend the analysis of approval voting to situations when individuals express approval for intervals on a circle. Previous work has analyzed bounds on the number of voters who approve of a single candidate when preferences live on a fixed interval or on a circle. This paper asks a different question: what is the minimum number of candidates needed

to satisfy all voters? The authors analyze the situation when individual approval sets are of equal length and consider both deterministic and probabilistic models.

Impossibility theorems involving weakenings of expansion consistency and resoluteness in voting, by Holliday, Norman, Pacuit, and Zahedian, examines how versions of Arrow's axiom of expansion consistency are incompatible with other fundamental axioms in voting theory including anonymity, neutrality and resoluteness. Specifically, the authors consider binary expansion consistency, which states that a candidate who is the social choice from an initial field of candidates, and who beats a new candidate in a pairwise comparison, should remain the social choice when the new candidate is added to the field. Using a SAT solver, the authors show that even weakened versions of resoluteness are incompatible with binary expansion consistency. The proof makes use of a novel method for extending impossibility results on pairwise and majority voting methods to impossibility results on all voting methods, which may have application in future analyses.

Voting on cyclic orders, group theory, and ballots, by Crisman, Holleran, Martin, and Noonan, uses representation theory to analyze both the ballots for voting on cyclic orders and points-based procedures that aggregate such ballots. In this setting, voters provide rankings of the cyclic orders of n candidates. The authors provide a full characterization of points-based voting procedures for two ballot types when $n = 4$ and offer observations for $n = 5$.

Conditions for fairness anomalies in instant-runoff voting, by Graham-Squire, extends previous work that analyzed necessary and sufficient conditions for instant-runoff voting to demonstrate monotonicity paradoxes for three-candidate when ballots are fully-ranked. In this paper, he determines necessary and sufficient conditions for monotonicity paradoxes for three-candidate elections when ballots are not fully ranked, and necessary conditions for elections with four or more candidates. Additionally, he examines no-show anomalies in three-candidates elections for both fully-ranked and not fully-ranked ballots.

In *An iterative procedure for apportionment and its use in the 2016 Georgia Republican primary*, by Jones, McCune and Wilson, the authors analyze an apportionment method used to allocate at-large delegates in Georgia to presidential candidates during the 2016 Republican presidential primary. This method, the Iterated Lower Quota method, is based on a sequence of rounds in which each candidate receive a succession of lower quotas. The authors analyze the properties of this method, including the maximum number of rounds that may occur, and compare it to Hamilton's method. They also discuss its implementation in the 2016 primaries.

Double moves by each player in chess openings make the game fairer, by Brams and Ismail, presents a high-level analysis of work also presented at the 2001 IEEE Conference on Games in which the authors make the case that the apparent advantage in chess given to white (as the first player) can be mitigated by changing the usual sequence of moves, WB/WB/WB/WB, to the sequence WB/BW/WB/WB....

How lies induced cooperation in Golden Balls: A game-theoretic analysis, by Brams and Mor, analyzes a well-known episode from the British TV game show *Golden Balls*, in which one of the two contestants lies about his strategy. This incident transformed a situation which can be modeled by a standard Prisoners'

Dilemma into a game in which the contestants were able to improve their outcomes from the expected one when both players defect.

We would like to thank the authors of these papers, as well as all the presenters in the 2022 AMS Special Section on the Mathematics of Decisions, Elections, and Games, for their interesting contributions and their enthusiastic participation, which was especially appreciated as the 2022 Joint Meetings were moved online. We hope this volume and the session contribute to strengthening the interdisciplinary community of mathematicians and others who work in these areas.

795 **Michael A. Jones, David McCune, and Jennifer M. Wilson, Editors,** Mathematical Analyses of Decisions, Voting and Games, 2024

792 **Shaoming Guo, Zane Kun Li, and Brian Street, Editors,** Recent Developments in Harmonic Analysis and its Applications, 2024

791 **Mee Seong Im, Bach Nguyen, and Arik Wilbert, Editors,** Algebraic and Topological Aspects of Representation Theory, 2024

790 **Peter Crooks and Alexandru I. Suciu, Editors,** Compactifications, Configurations, and Cohomology, 2023

789 **I. S. Krasil′shchik, A. B. Sossinsky, and A. M. Verbovetsky, Editors,** The Diverse World of PDEs, 2023

788 **I. S. Krasil′shchik, A. B. Sossinsky, and A. M. Verbovetsky, Editors,** The Diverse World of PDEs, 2023

787 **Hemen Dutta, Editor,** Mathematical Modelling, 2023

786 **Hemen Dutta, Editor,** Mathematical Modelling, 2023

785 **A. Leroy and S. K. Jain, Editors,** Algebra and Coding Theory, 2023

784 **Dinh-Liem Nguyen, Loc Hoang Nguyen, and Thi-Phong Nguyen, Editors,** Advances in Inverse Problems for Partial Differential Equations, 2023

783 **Alla Detinko, Michael Kapovich, Alex Kontorovich, Peter Sarnak, and Richard Schwartz, Editors,** Computational Aspects of Discrete Subgroups of Lie Groups, 2023

782 **Galina Filipuk, Alberto Lastra, and Sławomir Michalik, Editors,** Recent Trends in Formal and Analytic Solutions of Diff. Equations, 2023

781 **Emanuel Indrei, Diego Marcon, and Levon Nurbekyan, Editors,** Geometric and Functional Inequalities and Recent Topics in Nonlinear PDEs, 2023

780 **Erik Koelink, Stefan Kolb, Nicolai Reshetikhin, and Bart Vlaar, Editors,** Hypergeometry, Integrability and Lie Theory, 2022

779 **Samuele Anni, Valentijn Karemaker, and Elisa Lorenzo García, Editors,** Arithmetic, Geometry, Cryptography, and Coding Theory 2021, 2022

778 **Carlos Galindo, Alejandro Melle Hernández, Julio José Moyano-Fernández, and Wilson A. Zúñiga-Galindo, Editors,** p-Adic Analysis, Arithmetic and Singularities, 2022

777 **Bang-Yen Chen, Nicholas D. Brubaker, Takashi Sakai, Bogdan D. Suceavă, Makiko Sumi Tanaka, Hiroshi Tamaru, and Mihaela B. Vajiac, Editors,** Differential Geometry and Global Analysis, 2022

776 **Aaron Wootton, S. Allen Broughton, and Jennifer Paulhus, Editors,** Automorphisms of Riemann Surfaces, Subgroups of Mapping Class Groups and Related Topics, 2022

775 **Fernando Galaz-García, Cecilia González-Tokman, and Juan Carlos Pardo Millán, Editors,** Mexican Mathematicians in the World, 2021

774 **Randall J. Swift, Alan Krinik, Jennifer M. Switkes, and Jason H. Park, Editors,** Stochastic Processes and Functional Analysis, 2021

773 **Nicholas R. Baeth, Thiago H. Freitas, Graham J. Leuschke, and Victor H. Jorge Pérez, Editors,** Commutative Algebra, 2021

772 **Anatoly M. Vershik, Victor M. Buchstaber, and Andrey V. Malyutin, Editors,** Topology, Geometry, and Dynamics, 2021

771 **Nicolás Andruskiewitsch, Gongxiang Liu, Susan Montgomery, and Yinhuo Zhang, Editors,** Hopf Algebras, Tensor Categories and Related Topics, 2021

770 **Stéphane Ballet, Gaetan Bisson, and Irene Bouw, Editors,** Arithmetic, Geometry, Cryptography and Coding Theory, 2021

For a complete list of titles in this series, visit the
AMS Bookstore at **www.ams.org/bookstore/conmseries/**.

CONM 795

Decisions, Voting and Games • Jones et al., Editors

This volume contains the proceedings of the virtual AMS Special Session on Mathematics of Decisions, Elections and Games, held on April 8, 2022.

Decision theory, voting theory and game theory are three related areas of mathematics that involve making optimal decisions in different contexts. While these three areas are distinct, much of the recent research in these fields borrows techniques from other branches of mathematics such as algebra, combinatorics, convex geometry, logic, representation theory, etc. The papers in this volume demonstrate how the mathematics of decisions, elections and games can be used to analyze problems from the social sciences.

ISBN 978-1-4704-6978-8

9 781470 469788

CONM/795

AMS

www.ams.org