

## ON THE $w^*$ -SEQUENTIAL CLOSURE OF A CONE

R. D. McWILLIAMS

1. If  $X$  is a real Banach space and  $X^{**}$  the second conjugate space of  $X$ , then for each subset  $A$  of  $X^{**}$  let  $K_X(A)$  be the  $w^*$ -sequential closure of  $A$  in  $X^{**}$ ; thus  $F \in K_X(A)$  if and only if there is a sequence  $\{F_n\}$  in  $A$  such that  $F(f) = \lim_n F_n(f)$  for all  $f \in X^*$ . If  $J_X$  is the canonical mapping from  $X$  into  $X^{**}$ , then  $K_X(J_X X)$  is closed in the norm topology of  $X^{**}$  [1]. In the present paper it will be shown that if  $P$  is a norm-closed cone in  $X$ , then  $K_X(J_X P)$  is norm-closed in  $X^{**}$ , but  $K_X(K_X(J_X P))$  need not be norm-closed in  $X^{**}$ .

2. If  $s$  is a bounded real function on  $[0, 1]$ , let  $\|s\| = \sup_{0 \leq t \leq 1} |s(t)|$ . If  $S = \{s_k\}$  is a bounded sequence of functions, i.e., if each  $s_k$  is bounded and  $\sup_{k \in \omega} \|s_k\|$  is finite, let  $\|S\| = \sup_{k \in \omega} \|s_k\|$ . If  $Q$  is a set of functions, let  $L(Q)$  be the set of all functions  $x$  such that  $x$  is the pointwise limit of a bounded sequence in  $Q$ . Let  $\mathcal{A}$  be the collection of all double sequences  $A = \{a_{ki}\}$  of non-negative numbers such that for each  $k$  the following conditions are satisfied: (1)  $a_{ki} = 0$  for all  $i < k$  and for all but a finite number of  $i \geq k$ ; and (2)  $\sum_i a_{ki} = 1$ . If  $S = \{s_k\}$  is a sequence of functions and  $A \in \mathcal{A}$ , let  $T_A S$  be the sequence  $\{s'_k\}$  such that  $s'_k = \sum_i a_{ki} s_i$  for each  $k$ . It is clear that (1)  $T_A$  is a linear operator; (2) if  $S$  is bounded, then so is  $T_A S$  and  $\|T_A S\| \leq \|S\|$ ; (3) if  $S$  is pointwise convergent, then  $T_A S$  is pointwise convergent to the same limit.

**LEMMA 1.** *If  $R$  and  $S$  are bounded sequences in the space  $\mathcal{C}[0, 1]$  of continuous real functions on the interval  $[0, 1]$  and  $R$  and  $S$  converge pointwise to functions  $r$  and  $s$  respectively, then for each  $\epsilon > 0$  there exists  $A \in \mathcal{A}$  such that  $\|T_A R - T_A S\| < \|r - s\| + \epsilon$ .*

**PROOF.** The sequence  $R - S$  is bounded and converges pointwise to  $r - s$ . Hence by [1; proof of Lemma 1] there exists for each  $\epsilon > 0$  an  $A$  having the required property.

**LEMMA 2.** *Let  $P$  be a cone in  $\mathcal{C}[0, 1]$ , let  $\{z_n\}$  be a sequence in  $L(P)$ , and let  $z$  be a bounded function such that  $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \|z_n - z\| = 0$ . Then  $z \in L(P)$ .*

**PROOF.** It may be assumed that  $\|z_n - z\| < 2^{-n}$  for each  $n$ . For each

---

Presented to the Society, February 22, 1962 under the title  $w^*$ -sequential closure of a cone in a Banach space; received by the editors December 4, 1961.

$n$  there is a bounded sequence  $S_n = \{s_{nk}\}$  in  $P$  which converges point-wise to  $z_n$ ; by Lemma 1 it may be assumed that  $\|S_n\| < \|z\| + 2^{-n}$ .

By induction on  $n$  it can now be shown that for each  $n$  and for each  $i \leq n$  there exists a bounded sequence  $S_{in} = \{s_{ink}\}$  in  $P$  such that

$$(1) \quad \lim_{k \rightarrow \infty} s_{ink}(t) = z_i(t) \quad \text{for each } t \in [0, 1],$$

$$(2) \quad \lim_{k \rightarrow \infty} s_{ikk}(t) = z_i(t) \quad \text{for each } t \in [0, 1],$$

and

$$(3) \quad \|S_{in} - S_{jn}\| < 2^{1-i} \quad \text{if } i < j \leq n.$$

For  $n=1$ , the sequence  $S_{11}$  can be taken to be  $S_1$ . For  $n > 1$ , if  $S_{i,n-1}$  has been obtained for each  $i \leq n-1$ , Lemma 1 may be applied  $(n-1)$  times in succession to obtain  $A_1, \dots, A_{n-1} \in \mathcal{A}$  such that

$$(2.1) \quad \|T_{A_i} T_{A_{i-1}} \dots T_{A_1} (S_{i,n-1} - S_n)\| < 2^{1-i}$$

for each  $i < n$ . The induction step is completed by letting  $S_{in} = T_{A_{n-1}} \dots T_{A_1} S_{i,n-1}$  for each  $i < n$  and  $S_{nn} = T_{A_{n-1}} \dots T_{A_1} S_n$ .

Now let  $S = \{s_k\}$  be the bounded sequence in  $P$  such that  $s_k = s_{kk}$  for each  $k$ . Let  $t \in [0, 1]$  and  $i \in \omega$ . Then for every  $k \geq i$ ,

$$(2.2) \quad \begin{aligned} & |s_k(t) - z(t)| \\ & \leq |s_{kk}(t) - s_{ikk}(t)| + |s_{ikk}(t) - z_i(t)| + |z_i(t) - z(t)| \\ & < 3 \cdot 2^{-i} + |s_{ikk}(t) - z_i(t)|. \end{aligned}$$

Since by construction  $\lim_{k \rightarrow \infty} s_{ikk}(t) = z_i(t)$ , it follows that  $\lim_{k \rightarrow \infty} s_k(t) = z(t)$  for every  $t$ , so that  $z \in L(P)$ .

**THEOREM 1.** *If  $P$  is a norm-closed cone in a real Banach space  $X$ , then  $K_X(J_X P)$  is norm-closed in  $X^{**}$ .*

**PROOF.** Let  $F \in X^{**}$  be the limit in norm of a sequence  $\{F_n\} \subset K_X(J_X P)$ . Thus each  $F_n$  is the  $w^*$ -limit of a bounded [3, p. 209] sequence  $J_X S_n$ , where  $S_n = \{s_{nk}\} \subset P$ .

**CASE 1.** First suppose that  $X$  is a closed subspace of  $\mathcal{C}[0, 1]$ . For each  $t \in [0, 1]$  let  $f_t \in X^*$  be defined by  $f_t(s) = s(t)$  for all  $s \in X$ . Then for each  $n$  it follows that  $F_n(f_t) = \lim_{k \rightarrow \infty} s_{nk}(t)$ . If  $z_n$  is defined on  $[0, 1]$  by  $z_n(t) = F_n(f_t)$ , it follows that  $z_n \in L(P)$  and moreover, since  $\|f_t\| \leq 1$  for each  $t$ , that  $\|z_n - z_m\| \leq \|F_n - F_m\|$  for all  $n$  and  $m$ , so that the function  $z(t) = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} z_n(t)$  exists and belongs to  $L(P)$  by Lemma 2. Thus there is a bounded sequence  $\{s_k\} \subset P$  which converges point-wise to  $z$ . Since  $X$  is a subspace of  $\mathcal{C}[0, 1]$ , for each  $f \in X^*$  there is a finite regular signed Borel measure  $\mu_f$  on  $[0, 1]$  such that  $f(x)$

$= \int_0^1 x d\mu_f$  for every  $x \in X$  [3, p. 397]. Hence

$$(2.3) \quad F_n(f) = \lim_{k \rightarrow \infty} f(s_{nk}) = \int_0^1 z_n d\mu_f$$

for every  $n$ , and therefore

$$(2.4) \quad F(f) = \lim_n \int_0^1 z_n d\mu_f = \int_0^1 z d\mu_f = \lim_{k \rightarrow \infty} \int_0^1 s_k d\mu_f = \lim_{k \rightarrow \infty} f(s_k),$$

so that  $F$  is the  $w^*$ -limit of  $\{J_X s_k\}$ .

CASE 2. If  $X$  is an arbitrary real Banach space, let  $Y$  be the norm-closed subspace and  $Q$  the norm-closed cone in  $X$  generated by  $\{s_{nk}: n, k \in \omega\}$ . Since  $Y$  is separable, there is an equivalence mapping  $E$  from  $Y$  onto a closed subspace  $Z$  of  $\mathcal{C}[0, 1]$ . Since each  $F_n \in K_X(J_X P)$ , for each  $n$  an element  $G_n \in Y^{**}$  is unambiguously defined by

$$(2.5) \quad G_n(f|Y) = F_n(f) \quad \text{for all } f \in X^*.$$

The sequence  $\{G_n\}$  is clearly Cauchy since each  $g \in Y^*$  has an extension  $f \in X^*$  such that  $\|f\| = \|g\|$ . Since  $\{G_n\} \subset K_{Y^*}(Q)$ , it follows that the sequence  $\{E^{**}G_n\}$  is a Cauchy sequence in  $K_Z(J_Z E Q)$  converging in norm to  $E^{**}G$ . By Case 1 there is a bounded sequence  $\{z_k\} \subset EQ$  such that  $\{J_Z z_k\}$  is  $w^*$ -convergent to  $E^{**}G$  in  $Z^{**}$ . Finally, it is straightforward to verify that the sequence  $\{J_X E^{-1}z_k\} \subset J_X P$  is  $w^*$ -convergent to  $F$  in  $X^{**}$ .

3. For each  $t_0 \in [0, 2]$  and  $q \in \omega$  let  $f_{t_0, q} \in \mathcal{C}[0, 2]$  be defined by

$$(3.1) \quad f_{t_0, q}(t) = \max[0, 1 - 2^q |t - t_0|] \quad \text{for } t \in [0, 2].$$

If  $p, i$ , and  $j$  are positive integers, let  $s_{pi} = 2^{-pi}$  and  $t_j = 2 - 2^{-j}$ . Now if  $a > 1$  let  $X^a$  be the norm-closed subspace of  $\mathcal{C}[0, 2]$  generated by the set  $G^a = \{x_{pq}^a: p, q \in \omega\}$ , where

$$(3.2) \quad x_{pq}^a(t) = \max \left[ \max_{1 \leq i < 2^p} f_{s_{pi}, p+q}(t), \max_{p \leq j < p+q} a f_{t_j, j+q}(t) \right].$$

LEMMA 3. If  $P^a$  is the norm-closed cone in  $X^a$  generated by  $\{x_{pq}^a: p, q \in \omega\}$ , then the function  $x_0$  defined by

$$(3.3) \quad x_0(t) = \lim_{p \in \omega} \left[ \lim_{q \in \omega} x_{pq}^a(t) \right]$$

is an element of  $L(L(P^a))$  with  $\|x_0\| = 1$ , but if  $\{y^h\}$  is a bounded sequence in  $L(P^a)$  converging pointwise to  $x_0$ , then  $\limsup_{h \in \omega} \|y^h\| \geq a$ .

PROOF. It is trivial that  $x_0 \in L(L(P))$  and  $\|x_0\| = 1$ . Indeed,  $x_0$  is

the characteristic function of the set  $D = \{s_{pi} : p \in \omega, i < 2^p\}$ . If  $\{y^h\}$  is an arbitrary bounded sequence in  $L(P^a)$  converging pointwise to  $x_o$ , then since the set of all finite linear combinations of the  $x_{pq}^a$  with non-negative coefficients is dense in  $P^a$ , each  $y^h$  is the pointwise limit of a bounded sequence  $\{y^{hk}\}_{k=1}^\infty$ , where each  $y^{hk}$  has the form

$$(3.4) \quad y^{hk}(t) = \sum_{p \geq 1; q \geq 1} a_{pq}^{hk} x_{pq}^a(t),$$

where each  $a_{pq}^{hk}$  is non-negative and for each pair  $(h, k)$  only a finite number of the  $a_{pq}^{hk}$  are positive. Without changing the value of  $\limsup_{h \in \omega} \|y^h\|$ , it may be assumed that  $y^{hk}(\frac{1}{2}) = 1$  for all  $(h, k)$ .

Let  $\epsilon > 0$  be given. For each  $H \in \omega$  let

$$(3.5) \quad S_H = \{t \in [0, 1] : t \notin D, y^h(t) < \epsilon \text{ for all } h \geq H\}.$$

Since  $\bigcup_{H \in \omega} S_H$  is of the second category in  $[0, 1]$ , there exists an  $H$  such that  $S_H$  is dense in a closed interval  $I$ . Choose an arbitrary  $s_{p_o i_o} \in D \cap (\text{int } I)$  with  $i_o$  odd; then there exists  $H_o \geq H$  such that  $y^h(s_{p_o i_o}) > 1 - \epsilon$  for all  $h \geq H_o$ . Since there exist points of  $S_H$  between  $s_{p_o i_o}$  and every  $s_{pi}$  such that  $p < p_o$ , it is clear that for every  $h \geq H_o$ , there exists  $K_h$  such that for every  $k \geq K_h$ ,

$$(3.6) \quad \sum_{p \geq p_o; q \geq 1} a_{pq}^{hk} = y^{hk}(s_{p_o i_o}) - \sum_{p < p_o; q \geq 1} a_{pq}^{hk} x_{pq}^a(s_{p_o i_o}) > (1 - \epsilon) - 2\epsilon.$$

Now fix  $h \geq H_o$ . Since  $y^h$  is a Baire function of the first class, there exists a point  $\sigma_h \in I$  such that  $y^h|I$  is continuous at  $\sigma_h$  [2, p. 143]; hence there is a closed interval  $J \subset I$  such that  $y^h(t) < 2\epsilon$  for all  $t \in J$ . Choose  $s_{p_1 i_1} \in D \cap (\text{int } J)$  with  $p_1 > p_o$ ; then there exists  $K'_h \geq K_h$  such that for every  $k \geq K'_h$ ,

$$(3.7) \quad \sum_{p \geq p_1; q \geq 1} a_{pq}^{hk} \leq y^{hk}(s_{p_1 i_1}) < 2\epsilon.$$

Next, by (3.2), for every  $t \in [0, 1]$  and every  $k$ ,

$$(3.8) \quad \begin{aligned} y^{hk}(t) &\geq \sum_{p_o \leq p < p_1; q < p_1} a_{pq}^{hk} (1 - 2^{p+q} |t - s_{p_o i_o}|) \\ &\geq \sum_{p_o \leq p < p_1; q < p_1} a_{pq}^{hk} (1 - 2^{2p_1} |t - s_{p_o i_o}|). \end{aligned}$$

There exists  $t_o \in S_H$  such that  $|t_o - s_{p_o i_o}| < 2^{-(2p_1+1)}$ , and there exists  $K''_h \geq K'_h$  such that  $y^{hk}(t_o) < \epsilon$  whenever  $k \geq K''_h$ . Hence, by (3.8) with  $t = t_o$ ,

$$(3.9) \quad \sum_{p_0 \leq p < p_1; q < p_1} a_{pq}^{hk} < \frac{\epsilon}{1 - 2^{2p_1} |t_0 - s_{p_0 i_0}|} < 2\epsilon$$

for all  $k \geq K_h''$ . Therefore, by (3.6), (3.7), and (3.9),

$$(3.10) \quad \sum_{p_0 \leq p < p_1; q \geq p_1} a_{pq}^{hk} > 1 - 7\epsilon$$

for all  $k \geq K_h''$ , so that  $\|y^h\| \geq \lim_{k \rightarrow \infty} y^{hk}(t_{p_1}) \geq a(1 - 7\epsilon)$ . Since  $\epsilon$  may be an arbitrarily small positive number, it follows that  $\limsup_{h \in \omega} \|y^h\| \geq a$ .

**THEOREM 2.** *There exist a norm-closed subspace  $X$  of  $\mathcal{C}[0, 1]$  and a norm-closed cone  $P \subset X$  such that  $K_X(K_X(J_X P))$  is not norm-closed in  $X^{**}$ .*

**PROOF.** For each  $r \in \omega$  and each real function  $x$  defined on  $[0, 2]$  let  $E_r x$  be the function defined on  $[0, 1]$  by

$$(3.11) \quad (E_r x)(t) = \begin{cases} x(2^{r+1}[t - 2^{-r}]) & \text{if } 2^{-r} \leq t \leq 2^{1-r}, \\ 0 & \text{for all other } t. \end{cases}$$

Recalling the notation of Lemma 3 with  $a = 2^{2r}$ , observe that  $E_r | X^{2^{2r}}$  is an equivalence mapping onto a subspace of  $\mathcal{C}[0, 1]$ , since  $x(0) = x(2) = 0$  for all  $x \in X^{2^{2r}}$ . Let  $X$  be the closed subspace and  $P$  the closed cone in  $\mathcal{C}[0, 1]$  generated by  $\cup_{r \in \omega} \{E_r P^{2^{2r}}\}$ . For each  $r$  it is clear that  $E_r x_0 \in L(L(P))$  and hence that an  $F_r \in X^{**}$  can be unambiguously defined by

$$(3.12) \quad F_r(f) = \int_0^1 (E_r x_0) d\mu_f \quad \text{for all } f \in X^*;$$

then  $F_r \in K_X(K_X(J_X P))$  and  $\|F_r\| = 1$ . Now let  $F = \sum_{r \in \omega} 2^{-r} F_r$ ; thus  $F$  belongs to the closure of  $K_X(K_X(J_X P))$  in the norm topology.

Suppose  $F \in K_X(K_X(J_X P))$ . Then there is a bounded sequence  $\{G_h\} \subset K_X(J_X P)$  whose  $w^*$ -limit is  $F$ . For each pair  $(r, h)$  let  $z_{rh}$  be the function on  $[0, 2]$  defined by

$$(3.13) \quad z_{rh}(t) = G_h(f_{2^{-r+2^{-1-r}t}}) \quad \text{for } t \in [0, 2],$$

where  $f_u \in X^*$  is defined by  $f_u(x) = x(u)$  for  $x \in X$  and real  $u$ . Then  $\{z_{rh}\}_{h=1}^\infty$  is a bounded sequence in  $L(P^{2^{2r}})$  which converges pointwise on  $[0, 2]$  to  $2^{-r} x_0$ . By Lemma 3,  $\limsup_{h \in \omega} \|z_{rh}\| \geq 2^r$ , and hence  $\limsup_{h \in \omega} \|G_h\| \geq 2^r$ . Since  $r$  is an arbitrary positive integer, the sequence  $\{G_h\}$  is unbounded, which gives a contradiction. Thus  $F \notin K_X(K_X(J_X P))$  and the theorem is proved.

REMARK. The author has not been able to determine whether  $K_X(K_X(J_X X))$  can fail to be norm-closed in  $X^{**}$ .

## REFERENCES

1. R. D. McWilliams, *A note on weak sequential convergence*, Pacific J. Math. **12** (1962), 333–335.
2. I. P. Natanson, *Theory of functions of a real variable*, Vol. II (translated by L. F. Boron), Ungar, New York, 1960.
3. A. E. Taylor, *Functional analysis*, Wiley, New York, 1958.

FLORIDA STATE UNIVERSITY