

7. Y. C. Wong, *Existence of linear connections with respect to which given tensor fields are parallel or recurrent*, Nagoya Math. J. 24 (1964), 67-108.

NORTHWESTERN UNIVERSITY

---

## A NOTE ON A REDUCIBLE CONTINUUM

E. L. BETHEL

In [4], Knaster shows that there exists an irreducible compact metric continuum  $M$  which has a monotone continuous decomposition  $G$  such that each element of  $G$  is nondegenerate and  $M/G$  is an arc. Also, he raised the question as to whether there existed an irreducible continuum  $M$  which has a monotone continuous decomposition  $G$  such that each element of  $G$  is an arc and  $M/G$  is an arc. E. E. Moise settled this question in the negative in [5]. In [3], M. E. Hamstrom showed that if  $G$  is a monotone continuous decomposition of a compact metric continuum such that each element of  $G$  is a nondegenerate continuous curve and  $M/G$  is an arc, then it is not the case that  $M$  is irreducible. E. Dyer generalized this result by showing in [2] that if  $M$  is a compact metric continuum and  $G$  is a monotone continuous decomposition of  $M$  such that each element of  $G$  is nondegenerate and decomposable, then it is not the case that  $M$  is irreducible. A purpose of this note is to extend Dyer's result somewhat.

The author is indebted to the referee for some suggestions which have been incorporated in this note. In particular, a weakened hypothesis in Theorem 2.

**THEOREM 1.** *Let  $M$  denote a compact metric continuum and  $G$  a nondegenerate monotone continuous decomposition of  $M$  each of whose elements is nondegenerate. If  $H$  is a subcollection of  $G$  each of whose elements is snakelike and indecomposable, and if  $H^*$  is dense in  $M$ , then uncountably many elements of  $G$  are indecomposable.*

**PROOF.** Let  $I_1$  denote an element of  $H$ , and let  $C_1$  denote the first chain in a sequence of defining chains for  $I_1$ , and let  $L_1$  and  $L_2$  denote the end links of  $C_1$ . Since  $H^*$  is dense in  $M$ , and  $G$  is a continuous collection,  $C_1$  contains two elements  $I(10)$  and  $I(11)$  of  $H$  such that  $I(10)$  and  $I(11)$  intersects every link of  $C_1$ . Let  $\{C_n(10)\}$  and  $\{C_n(11)\}$  denote chain sequences which define  $I(10)$  and  $I(11)$  respectively.

---

Presented to the Society, November 13, 1965 under the title *On reducibility of continua*; received by the editors January 11, 1965.

It follows that there is some  $C_i(10)$  of  $\{C_n(10)\}$  and some  $C_j(11)$  of  $\{C_n(11)\}$  such that (1) each is a refinement of  $C_1$ , (2) each has links intersecting the first and last links of  $C_1$ , and (3) there exist points  $A_1$  and  $A_2$  of  $L_1$  and  $L_2$  respectively, such that if  $U$  is a coherent two region collection of either  $C_i(10)$  or  $C_j(11)$  which intersects  $A_i$ , ( $i=1, 2$ ), then  $U^* \subset L_i$ , ( $i=1, 2$ ). Furthermore, the closure of the union of both chains does not intersect  $I_1$ , and the diameter of each link is less than  $1/2$ . By Theorem 2 of [1], there is some  $C(10)$  of  $\{C_n(10)\}$  and a  $C(11)$  of  $\{C_n(11)\}$  such that  $C(10)$  and  $C(11)$  each is a refinement of and loop in  $C_i(10)$  and  $C_j(11)$  respectively. It is an easy exercise to show that both  $C(10)$  and  $C(11)$  loop in  $C_1$  also.

Now repeat the process used for the construction of  $C(10)$  and  $C(11)$  in both  $C(10)$  and  $C(11)$ , where  $C(10)$  and  $C(11)$  assume the role of  $C_1$  and each of  $I(10)$  and  $I(11)$  assume the role of  $I_1$ . By induction, we may define a sequence of chains  $\{C(i_1 \cdots i_n)\}$ , ( $i_k=0, 1$ ), such that (1)  $I(i_1 \cdots i_n)$  is an element of  $H$  which is a subset of the union of the links of  $C(i_1 \cdots i_n)$  and intersects each link of  $C(i_1 \cdots i_n)$ , (2)  $C(i_1 \cdots i_n k)$ , ( $k=0, 1$ ), loops and is a refinement of  $C(i_1 \cdots i_n)$ , and (3) each link of  $C(i_1 \cdots i_n)$  has diameter less than  $1/n$ . Thus, each sequence  $\{i_n\}$ , ( $i_n=0, 1$ ), defines a sequence of chains such that the common part of the sequence of chains is an indecomposable continuum  $I$  by Theorem 2 of [1]. Since  $I(i_1 \cdots i_n)$  intersects each link of  $C(i_1 \cdots i_n)$ , we have a sequence of elements of  $G$  converging to  $I$ , and  $I \cap I(i_1 \cdots i_n) = \emptyset$ , it follows that  $I \in G$ . Since there are uncountably many sequences  $\{i_n\}$ ,  $G$  contains uncountably many snakelike indecomposable continua.

**THEOREM 2.** *Let  $M$  denote a compact irreducible continuum, and let  $G$  be a nondegenerate monotone continuous decomposition of  $M$  each of whose elements is nondegenerate and either snakelike or decomposable. If  $M/G$  has a dense set of separating points, then uncountably many elements of  $G$  are indecomposable.*

**PROOF.** Suppose the contrary. Let  $G'$  denote the elements of  $G$  which are indecomposable and suppose  $G'$  is countable. Now  $(G')^*$  is not dense in  $M$  since this would imply that  $G'$  is uncountable by Theorem 1. Let  $A$  and  $B$  denote two points between which  $M$  is irreducible, and let  $g$  denote a separating element of  $G$  which does not belong to  $G'$ . There exists an open set  $D$  with respect to  $M/G$  containing  $g$  such that  $\bar{D} \cap (H \cup g_A \cup g_B) = \emptyset$ , where  $g_A$  and  $g_B$  are the elements of  $G$  containing  $A$  and  $B$  respectively. There is some subcontinuum  $K$  of  $M/G$  such that  $K$  is irreducible from  $M/G - D$  to  $g$ . It follows that each element of  $K$  is decomposable. Since the set of

separating points are dense in  $M/G$ , there is a separating point  $g'$  of  $K$  distinct from  $g$ . Furthermore, there is a subcontinuum  $K'$  of  $K$  irreducible from  $g'$  to  $g$ . But since each element of  $K'$  is decomposable, by Dyer's theorem, there is a proper subcontinuum  $L$  of  $(K')^*$  intersecting  $g$  and  $g'$ . Since  $g$  and  $g'$  are separating points of  $M/G$ , it now easily follows that  $M$  is not irreducible from  $A$  to  $B$ , a contradiction. Hence, uncountably many elements of  $G$  are indecomposable.

REMARK. May the stipulation that  $M/G$  has a dense set of separating points be removed or replaced by a weaker stipulation? Indeed, may the stipulation that the indecomposable elements be snakelike be removed?

#### REFERENCES

1. L. K. Barrett, *The structure of decomposable snakelike continua*, Duke Math. J. **28** (1961), 515–521.
2. E. Dyer, *Irreducibility of the sum of the elements of a continuous collection of continua*, Duke Math. J. **20** (1953), 589.
3. M. E. Hamstrom, *Continuous collections of continuous curves*, Bull. Amer. Math. Soc. **58** (1952), 204.
4. B. Knaster, *Un continua irréductible à décomposition continue en tranches*, Fund. Math. **25** (1953), 568–577.
5. E. E. Moise, *Monotone interior transformations*, Bull. Amer. Math. Soc. **55** (1949), 810–811.

CLEMSON UNIVERSITY