

# A NOTE ON AN EXAMPLE OF STALLINGS<sup>1</sup>

R. B. SHER

1. **Introduction.** R. H. Bing [1] has shown that Euclidean 3-space  $E^3$  does not contain an uncountable collection of pairwise disjoint wild closed surfaces. J. Stallings [3] gave an example of an uncountable collection of pairwise disjoint wild disks in  $E^3$ . J. Martin [2] showed that in an uncountable collection of pairwise disjoint disks all but a countable number of elements of the collection lie on a 2-sphere. In a review of Martin's paper, O. G. Harrold pointed out that what is apparently unknown is whether an uncountable collection of pairwise disjoint disks must contain a pair of equivalently imbedded elements. The purpose of this note is to show that it need not.

We use  $E^3$  to denote the set of all 3-tuples  $(x_1, x_2, x_3)$  of real numbers with the usual topology. We identify  $E^1$  (the reals) with the  $x_1$ -axis in  $E^3$ , and  $E^2$  (the plane) with the  $x_1x_2$ -coordinate plane. We use coordinates  $(x_1, x_2)$  rather than  $(x_1, x_2, 0)$  to represent points of  $E^2$ .

Compact sets  $H$  and  $K$  are *equivalently imbedded* in  $E^3$  if there is a homeomorphism of  $E^3$  onto itself which carries  $H$  onto  $K$ . If there is a polyhedron  $P$  so that  $H$  and  $P$  are equivalently imbedded, we say that  $H$  is *tame*. Otherwise,  $H$  is *wild*. The set  $H$  is *locally tame* at  $p \in H$  if there is a neighborhood  $N$  of  $p$  so that the closure of  $N \cap H$  is tame. If  $W$  is a closed subset of  $H$  and  $H$  is locally tame at each point of  $H - W$ ,  $H$  is said to be *locally tame modulo  $W$* .

If  $D$  is a disk or 3-cell,  $\text{Bd } D$  will denote the boundary simple closed curve or 2-sphere of  $D$ . We use  $\text{Cl } H$  for the closure of the point set  $H$ .

2. **Construction.** Let  $M$  be the usual "middle-third" Cantor set in  $[0, 1] \subset E^1$ . That is,  $M = \bigcup_{i=0}^{\infty} K_i$  where  $K_0 = [0, 1]$  and  $K_i$  is the union of the  $2^i$  pairwise disjoint closed intervals obtained by removing the middle-third open interval from each component of  $K_{i-1}$  if  $i = 1, 2, 3, \dots$ . If  $i = 1, 2, 3, \dots$ , we shall denote the  $2^i$  components of  $K_i$  by  $L_1^i, L_2^i, L_3^i, \dots, L_{2^i}^i$  where each point of  $L_j^i$  precedes each point of  $L_{j+1}^i$  if  $j = 1, 2, \dots$  or  $2^i - 1$ . We denote  $L_j^i \cap M$  by  $M_j^i$ .

We now define a sequence  $N_1, N_2, N_3, \dots$  of Cantor sets in  $E^2$  so that

$$N = \text{Cl} \left( \bigcup_{i=1}^{\infty} N_i \right) = M \cup \left( \bigcup_{i=1}^{\infty} N_i \right)$$

Received by the editors February 14, 1967.

<sup>1</sup> This research was supported by NSF Grant GP-6016.

is a Cantor set. The set  $N_i$  is defined to be

$$\left[ \bigcup_{k=1}^{2^{i-1}} (M_{2k-1}^i \times \{2/3^i\}) \right] \cup \left[ \bigcup_{k=1}^{2^{i-1}} (M_{2k}^i \times M_2^i) \right].$$

Now let  $\{S_\alpha\}$  be the set of all infinite sequences each of whose terms is either 0 or 1. If  $S_\alpha$  is the sequence  $m_1, m_2, m_3, \dots$ , we associate the sequence  $L_{\bar{m}_1}^1 \supset L_{\bar{m}_2}^2 \supset L_{\bar{m}_3}^3 \supset \dots$  with  $S_\alpha$  where  $\bar{m}_j$  is odd if  $m_j$  is 0 and even if  $m_j$  is 1. The correspondence  $S_\alpha \rightarrow \bigcap_{i=1}^\infty L_{\bar{m}_i}^i = p_\alpha \in M$  is a 1-1 correspondence between the elements of  $\{S_\alpha\}$  and the points of  $M$ . Notice that the subset  $\{S'_\alpha\}$  of  $\{S_\alpha\}$ , consisting of those members of  $\{S_\alpha\}$  in which no 1's appear adjacent to one another, has cardinality of the continuum.<sup>2</sup>

Now let  $Q$  be a 3-cell in  $E^3$  such that  $\text{Bd } Q$  is locally tame modulo a Cantor set  $C$  and so that any arc on  $\text{Bd } Q$  which intersects  $C$  is wild. An example of such a cell is described by Stallings in [3]. There is a homeomorphism  $h: Q \rightarrow Q' = \{(x_1, x_2, x_3) \mid 0 \leq x_i \leq 1, i = 1, 2, 3\}$  so that  $h(C) = N$ . Let  $D'_\alpha$  be the intersection of  $Q'$  with the plane  $x_1 = p'_\alpha$  where  $p'_\alpha$  is associated with the sequence  $S'_\alpha$ , and let  $D_\alpha = h^{-1}(D'_\alpha)$ .

The set  $\{D_\alpha\}$  is an uncountable collection of pairwise disjoint wild disks in  $E^3$ . The boundary of each  $D_\alpha$  is locally tame modulo  $D_\alpha \cap C$ . A description of the wild set of  $\text{Bd } D_\alpha$  is given by examining the sequence  $S'_\alpha$ . To each 0 in  $S'_\alpha$  there corresponds an isolated wild point of  $\text{Bd } D_\alpha$ , and to each 1 in  $S'_\alpha$  there corresponds a Cantor set of wild points, and  $S'_\alpha$  describes the relative order of these "components" of the wild set on  $\text{Bd } D_\alpha$ . The fact that a space homeomorphism taking one disk onto another must necessarily carry wild points to wild points and the choice of the sequences  $\{S'_\alpha\}$  shows that no pair of the disks  $\{D_\alpha\}$  are equivalently imbedded in  $E^3$ .

REFERENCES

1. R. H. Bing, *E<sup>3</sup> does not contain uncountably many mutually exclusive wild surfaces*, Abstract 801t, Bull. Amer. Math. Soc. **63** (1957), 404.
2. J. Martin, *A note on uncountably many disks*, Pacific J. Math. **13** (1963), 1331-1333.
3. J. R. Stallings, *Uncountably many wild disks*, Ann. of Math. (2) **71** (1960), 185-186.

UNIVERSITY OF GEORGIA

---

<sup>2</sup> In fact, as pointed out by the referee, the image of the set  $\{S'_\alpha\}$  under the 1-1 correspondence  $S_\alpha \rightarrow p_\alpha$  is a Cantor set thus showing that there is an uncountable compact collection of pairwise disjoint disks, no two of which are equivalently imbedded.