PROCEEDINGS OF THE
AMERICAN MATHEMATICAL SOCIETY
Volume 62, Number 1, January 1977

ASYMPTOTIC NONBASES WHICH ARE NOT SUBSETS OF MAXIMAL ASYMPTOTIC NONBASES

JULIEN HENNEFELD

ABSTRACT. Let A be a set of positive integers. If all but a finite number of the positive integers can be written as a sum of h elements of A, then A is called an asymptotic basis of order h. Otherwise, A is called an asymptotic nonbasis of order h. For each $h \geqslant 2$, we construct an asymptotic nonbasis of order h which is not a subset of a maximal asymptotic nonbasis of order h.

For A, a set of positive integers, let hA denote the set of all sums of h not necessarily distinct elements of A. If hA contains all but finitely many of the positive integers, then A is an asymptotic basis of order h. If A is an asymptotic nonbasis of order h, but $A \cup \{a\}$ is an asymptotic basis of order h for every positive integer $a \notin A$, then A is called a maximal asymptotic nonbasis of order h.

The question of whether every asymptotic nonbasis of order h is a subset of some maximal asymptotic nonbasis of order h was originally posed by Nathanson [3] and repeated by Erdös and Nathanson [1], [2].

THEOREM. *For $h \geqslant 2$, let $A = \{1\} \cup \{h\} \cup$ {all multiples of h, except $q_1, q_2, q_3, \ldots$}, where $\{q_i\}$ is an increasing sequence of multiples of h, with $\lim(q_{i+1} - q_i) = \infty$. Then A is an asymptotic nonbasis of order h which is not a subset of any maximal asymptotic nonbasis of order h.*

PROOF. To simplify the notation, we will only give the proof for $h > 3$. Clearly, since 1 is the only element of A not congruent to 0 $(\operatorname{mod} h)$, hA will miss all integers of the form $q_i + h - 1$. Also, note that all but finitely many of the integers that hA misses are of the form $q_i + h - 1$. This is because for all i sufficiently large,

$$q_i + h - 2 = (q_i - h) + h + 1 + \cdots + 1$$

is the sum of h elements of A. Also,

$$q_i + h - 3 = (q_i - 2h) + h + h + 1 + \cdots + 1$$

Received by the editors March 15, 1976.
AMS (MOS) subject classifications (1970). Primary 10L05, 10L10, 10J99.
Key words and phrases. Sum sets, asymptotic bases, asymptotic nonbases, maximal nonbases.

is the sum of h elements of A. Similarly, all integers in $[q_i, q_i + h - 2]$ have representations as sums of h elements in A. Every integer in $[q_i + h, q_{i+1}]$ is in hA for i sufficiently large, because each $q_i + rh$ in (q_i, q_{i+1}) can be expressed as a sum of j elements from A for each j in $[1, h]$.

We claim that if x is any integer greater than 1, which is not congruent to $0 \pmod h$, then $A \cup \{x\}$ is an asymptotic basis of order h. To prove this claim we will consider separately the two cases: $x \equiv 1 \pmod h$ and $x \not\equiv 1 \pmod h$.

If $x \equiv 1 \pmod h$, then for all i sufficiently large,

$$q_i + 1 = x + [q_i - (x - 1)]$$

is the sum of two elements of $A \cup \{x\}$, and thus by $h - 2$ additions of 1, $q_i + h - 1$ will be the sum of h elements of $A \cup \{x\}$.

If $x \not\equiv 1 \pmod h$, take m large enough so that $hx < q_i - q_{i-1}$, for all $i \geqslant m$. Pick p: $ph < x < (p + 1)h$. Then $q_i + 1 < (q_i - ph) + x < q_i + h$. Since $(q_i - ph) + x$ is the sum of two elements from $A \cup \{x\}$, $q_i + h - 1$ can be expressed as a sum of fewer than h elements of $A \cup \{x\}$. To express it as a sum of exactly h elements, use an expression of the form

$$[q_i - (p + r)h] + x + h + \cdots + h + 1 + \cdots + 1.$$

Thus the claim is proved.

Therefore, the only hope for extending A to a maximal asymptotic nonbasis is by adjoining B, a subset of $\{q_1, q_2, \ldots\}$. However, if there are infinitely many q_i missing from B, then $A \cup B$ will be a nonbasis which is not maximal. If there are only finitely many q_i missing from B, then $A \cup B$ will be a basis. In neither case will $A \cup B$ be a maximal nonbasis.

REMARK. The author originally constructed the example $A = \{1\} \cup \{$all multiples of h, except $h^2, h^3, h^4, \ldots\}$ and wishes to thank M. B. Nathanson for pointing out the somewhat more general example given in this paper.

REFERENCES

1. P. Erdös and M. B. Nathanson, *Maximal asymptotic nonbases*, Proc. Amer. Math. Soc. **48** (1975), 57–60. MR **50** #9831.

2. ———, *Oscillations of bases for the natural numbers*, Proc. Amer. Math. Soc. **53** (1975), 253–258.

3. M. B. Nathanson, *Minimal bases and maximal nonbases in additive number theory*, J. Number Theory **6** (1974), 324–333. MR **50** #265.

4. A. Stöhr, *Gelöste und ungelöstee Fragen über Basen der natürlichen Zahlentheorie*. I, J. Reine Angew Math. **194** (1955), 40–65.

DEPARTMENT OF MATHEMATICS, BROOKLYN COLLEGE, CUNY, BROOKLYN, NEW YORK 11210