

## GENERALIZATION OF A RESULT OF BORWEIN AND DITOR

HARRY I. MILLER

(Communicated by R. Daniel Mauldin)

**ABSTRACT.** D. Borwein and S. Z. Ditor have found a measurable subset  $A$  of the real line having positive Lebesgue measure and a decreasing sequence  $(d_n)$  of reals converging to zero such that, for each  $x$ ,  $x + d_n$  is not in  $A$  for infinitely many  $n$ ; thus answering a question of P. Erdős. It will be shown that the result of Borwein and Ditor can be extended using a general 2-place function in place of plus. Related material is also presented.

### 1. INTRODUCTION

D. Borwein and S. Z. Ditor [1] have proved the following theorem, answering a question of P. Erdős.

**Theorem B and D.** (1) *If  $A$  is a measurable set of real numbers with  $m(A) > 0$  and  $(d_n)$  is a sequence converging to zero, then, for almost all  $x \in A$ ,  $x + d_n \in A$  for infinitely many  $n$ .*

(2) *There is a measurable set  $A$ , with  $m(A) > 0$  and a monotonic sequence  $(d_n)$  of positive reals converging to zero such that, for each  $x$ ,  $x + d_n \notin A$  for infinitely many  $n$ .*

The Baire set analogue of (2) is not true. In [2] it is shown that if  $A$  is a subset of the real line satisfying the Baire property (see [3]) and  $(d_n)$  is a sequence converging to zero, then the set

$$A \setminus \{x \in A : x + d_n \in A \text{ for all but finitely many } n\}$$

is of the first Baire category.

Suppose that  $A$  is a measurable set of positive reals and  $(e_n)$  is a sequence converging to one. It is natural to consider a multiplicative version of the Theorem of Borwein and Ditor. In this paper, we extend the Theorem of Borwein and Ditor to a general result that includes the operations of addition

---

Received by the editors April 25, 1988.

1980 *Mathematics Subject Classification* (1985 Revision). Primary 28A05, 26A21.

The research for this paper was supported by the Scientific Research Fund of Bosna and Herzegovina.

and multiplication as special cases by using general 2-place functions that satisfy appropriate conditions.

## 2. RESULTS

Our first theorem, an extension of part (2) of the Theorem of Borwein and Ditor, is the main result of this paper.

**Theorem 1.** *If  $f: R \times R \rightarrow R$  (the real line) is a function satisfying the following conditions:*

- (a) *there exists an  $e \in R$  such that  $f(x, e) = x$  for every  $x \in R$ ;*
- (b)  *$f_x$  and  $f_y$  (partial derivatives) exist and are continuous in a neighborhood of  $(x_0, e)$ , for some  $x_0 \in R$ ;*
- (c)  *$f_y(x_0, e) > 0$ ,*

*then there exists a strictly decreasing sequence  $(e_n)$  of real numbers converging to  $e$  and a measurable subset  $A$  of  $R$  with  $m(A) > 0$  such that, for all  $x \in R$ ,  $f(x, e_n) \notin A$  for infinitely many  $n$ .*

*Proof.* By (a) and (c),  $f_y(x_0, e) = a > 0$  and  $f_x(x_0, e) = 1$ . Therefore, by (b), there exist  $x_1 > x_0$  and  $y_1 > e$  such that  $f_x$  and  $f_y$  exist and are continuous on the closed rectangular body  $T$  having corners at  $(x_0, e)$ ,  $(x_0, y_1)$ ,  $(x_1, y_1)$ ,  $(x_1, e)$ ,  $f_y > a/2$  and  $f_x > 0$  on  $T$ . Let  $t = y_1 - e$ . There exists an integer  $n_0$ ,  $n_0 > 2$  such that  $(a/2)(t/2) > (x_1 - x_0)/n_0$ . Divide  $[x_0, x_1]$  into  $n_0$  abutting closed intervals, each of length  $(x_1 - x_0)/n_0$ ; denote them by  $I_1, I_2, \dots, I_{n_0}$ . Let  $J_1, J_2, \dots, J_{n_0}$  be  $n_0$  open intervals of equal length satisfying:

- (i)  $J_i \subset I_i$  for  $i = 1, 2, \dots, n_0$ .
- (ii)  $J_i$  and  $I_i$  have the same right-hand end points for each  $i = 1, 2, \dots, n_0$ .
- (iii) The set  $A_1 = [x_0, x_1] \setminus (\bigcup_{i=1}^{n_0} J_i \cup \{x_1\})$  has measure greater than  $(0.9)(x_1 - x_0)$ .

Then, clearly,  $A_1$  can be written as  $A_1 = \bigcup_{i=1}^{n_0} H_i$ ; where the  $H_i$ 's are closed, disjoint intervals of equal length. Since  $f_x$  is bounded on  $T$ , by the mean value theorem for derivatives applied to  $f_x$ , there exists a  $d_1 > 0$  such that if  $K$  is a closed subinterval of  $[x_0, x_1]$  of length less than  $d_1$  and  $e < \bar{e} < y_1$ , then the closed interval  $f(K, \bar{e}) = \{f(x, \bar{e}) : x \in K\}$  has length less than  $u_1/2$ , where  $u_1$  is the common length of the  $J_i$ 's.

Let  $m_1, m_1 > 2$ , be an integer satisfying the inequality  $\min(d_1, (a/2)(t/2^2)) > (x_1 - x_0)/m_1 n_0$ . Divide each of the closed intervals  $H_i$  into  $m_1$  abutting closed intervals of equal length; denote these intervals by  $H_{i1}, H_{i2}, \dots, H_{im_1}$ .

Suppose  $K$  is an interval in the collection  $\{H_{ij} : 1 \leq i \leq n_0, 1 \leq j \leq m_1\}$ , say  $K = H_{ij}$ . By the mean value theorem for derivatives applied to  $f_y$  and the definition of  $n_0$ , there exists an  $e_K$ ,  $e < e_K < e + t/2$ , such that  $L_{J_i} < f(L_K, e_K) < M_{J_i}$ , where  $L_{J_i}$  and  $L_K$  denote the left end points of  $J_i$  and

$K$  respectively and  $M_{J_i}$  denotes the midpoint of  $J_i$ . Furthermore, since the length of  $K$  is less than  $(x_1 - x_0)/m_1 n_0$ , which in turn is less than  $d_1$ , it follows that  $f(K, e_K)$  has length less than  $u_1/2$  and hence  $f(K, e_K) \subset J_i$ . Of course, for each  $K$ ,  $e_K$  is highly nonunique; namely, if  $e_{K'}$  is sufficiently close to  $e_K$  than  $f(K, e_{K'}) \subset J_i$  still holds.

Therefore, there exist  $m_1 n_0$  distinct points  $\{e_{1i}\}_{i=1}^{m_1 n_0}$ , each strictly between  $e$  and  $e + t/2$ , such that for each  $x \in A_1$ , there exists a point  $e_x \in \{e_{1i} : i = 1, 2, \dots, m_1 n_0\}$  such that  $f(x, e_x) \notin A_1$ .

Suppose now that  $\{J_{ij} : 1 \leq i \leq n_0, 1 \leq j \leq m_1\}$  is a collection of open intervals of equal length satisfying:

- (iv)  $J_{ij} \subset H_{ij}$  for all  $1 \leq i \leq n_0$  and  $1 \leq j \leq m_1$ .
- (v)  $J_{ij}$  and  $H_{ij}$  have the same right-hand end points for all  $1 \leq i \leq n_0$  and  $1 \leq j \leq m_1$ .
- (vi)  $A_2 = \bigcup_{i=1}^{n_0} (H_i \setminus (\bigcup_{j=1}^{m_1} J_{ij} \cup \{b_i\}))$  has measure greater than  $(0.9)(x_1 - x_0)$ , where  $b_i$  is the right end point of  $H_i$  for each  $1 \leq i \leq n_0$ .

Let  $u_2$  denote the common length of the  $J_{ij}$ 's. Again, since  $f_x$  is bounded on  $T$ , by the mean value theorem there exists a  $d_2 > 0$  such that  $f(K, \bar{e})$  has length less than  $u_2/2$  for every closed subinterval  $K$  of  $[x_0, x_1]$  of length less than  $d_2$  and every  $\bar{e}, e < \bar{e} < y_1$ .

Let  $m_2, m_2 > 2$  be an integer satisfying the inequality

$$\min(d_2, (a/2)(t/2^3)) > (x_1 - x_0)/(m_2 m_1 n_0).$$

Divide each of the  $m_1 n_0$  disjoint closed intervals of equal length making up  $A_2$  into  $m_2$  abutting closed intervals of equal length. Denote the  $m_2$  abutting closed intervals making up  $H_{ij}$  by  $H_{ij1}, H_{ij2}, \dots, H_{ijm_2}$ .

Suppose  $K$  is an interval in the collection  $\{H_{ijk} : 1 \leq i \leq n_0, 1 \leq j \leq m_1, 1 \leq k \leq m_2\}$ , say  $K = H_{ijk}$ . By the mean value theorem applied to  $f_y$  and the definition of  $m_1$ , there exists an  $e_K, e < e_K < e + t/2^2$ , such that  $L_{J_{ij}} < f(L_K, e_K) < M_{J_{ij}}$ , where  $L_{J_{ij}}$  and  $L_K$  are the left end points of  $J_{ij}$  and  $K$  respectively and  $M_{J_{ij}}$  is the midpoint of  $J_{ij}$ . Furthermore, since the length of  $K$  is less than  $(x_1 - x_0)/(m_2 m_1 n_0)$  which in turn is less than  $d_2$ , it follows that  $f(K, e_K)$  has length less than  $u_2/2$  and hence  $f(K, e_K) \subset J_{ij}$ .

Therefore, there exist  $m_2 m_1 n_0$  distinct numbers  $\{e_{2i}\}_{i=1}^{m_2 m_1 n_0}$ , each different from the points in  $\{e_{1i}\}_{i=1}^{m_1 n_0}$  and such that each number  $e_{2i}$  lies strictly between  $e$  and  $e + t/2^2$  and such that for each  $x \in A_2$ , there exists a point  $e_x \in \{e_{2i}\}_{i=1}^{m_2 m_1 n_0}$  such that  $f(x, e_x) \notin A_2$ .

This process can be continued by mathematical induction. In this way we obtain sequences

$$\{m_i\}_{i=1}^{\infty}, \quad \{e_{ij}\}_{j=1}^{m_i m_{i-1} \cdots m_2 m_1 n_0}, \quad \{A_i\}_{i=1}^{\infty}$$

satisfying the following conditions.

- (vii) Each  $m_i$  is an integer greater than 2.
- (viii) All of the numbers  $e_{ij}$  are distinct and for each  $i \in N$  (the natural numbers),  $e_{ij}$  lies strictly between  $e$  and  $e + t/2^i$  for each  $j = 1, 2, \dots, m_i m_{i-1} \cdots m_2 m_1 n_0$ .
- (ix) Each set  $A_i$  is a closed subset of  $[x_0, x_1]$ ,  $A_{i+1} \subset A_i$  for each  $i \in N$  and  $m(A_i) > (0.9)(x_1 - x_0)$  for each  $i \in N$ . For each  $x \in A_i$ , there exists a point  $e_x \in \{e_{ij}\}_{j=1}^{m_i m_{i-1} \cdots m_2 m_1 n_0}$ , such that  $f(x, e_x) \notin A_i$ .

Let  $\{e_n\}$  denote the set  $\{e_{ij} : i \in N, 1 \leq j \leq m_i m_{i-1} \cdots m_2 m_1 n_0\}$  written as a strictly decreasing sequence and let  $A = \bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} A_n$ .

Clearly  $m(A) \geq (0.9)(x_1 - x_0) > 0$  and, by (viii)  $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} e_n = e$ . If  $x \in A$ , then, by (ix),  $f(x, e_n) \notin A$  for infinitely many  $n$ . Finally, if  $x \notin A$ ; since  $A$  is closed,  $f(x, e) = x$  and  $f$  is continuous; it follows that there exists an  $n_x \in N$  such that  $f(x, e_n) \notin A$  for every  $n$ ,  $n \geq n_x$ .

**Remark 1.** Theorem 1 can be extended by replacing condition (a) by the hypothesis that  $f_x(x_0, e) > 0$ . Furthermore an  $n$ -dimensional version of Theorem 1 is valid under appropriate conditions on  $f: R^n \times R^n \rightarrow R^n$ .

Our next result is an extension of part (1) of Theorem B and D.

**Theorem 2.** If  $A$  is a measurable set of real numbers with  $m(A) > 0$  and  $f: R \times R \rightarrow R$  is a function satisfying the following conditions:

- (d) there exists an  $e \in R$  such that  $f(x, e) = x$  for every  $x \in R$ ;
- (e)  $f_x$  and  $f_y$  exist and are continuous everywhere;
- (f)  $f_y(x, e) > 0$  for all  $x \in R$ ;

and  $(e_n)$  is a sequence converging to  $e$ , then, for almost all  $x \in A$ ,  $f(x, e_n) \in A$  for infinitely many  $n$ .

*Proof.* Let  $m \in N$  and let  $A_m$  denote the set  $A \cap (-m, m)$ . For each  $\bar{\varepsilon} > 0$ , since  $A_m$  is bounded and measurable, there exists a positive integer  $n = n(\bar{\varepsilon})$  and there are disjoint intervals  $I_1, I_2, \dots, I_n$  such that

$$(*) \quad A_m = \left( \bigcup_{k=1}^n I_k \cup E_2 \right) \setminus E_1$$

where  $E_1$  and  $E_2$  each have outer Lebesgue measure less than  $\bar{\varepsilon}$ .

Let  $\varepsilon > 0$ . By (\*) and the conditions on  $f$  there exists a subsequence  $(n_k)_{k=1}^{\infty}$  of the natural numbers such that

$$m(A_m \setminus f(A_m, e_{n_k})) < \varepsilon/2^k \quad \text{for each } k.$$

From this it follows that  $\{x \in A_m : x \text{ is not in infinitely many of the sets } f(A_m, e_n)\}$  has measure less than  $\varepsilon$  for each  $\varepsilon > 0$ . Since this holds for each  $m \in N$  it follows that for almost all  $x \in A$ ,  $f(x, e_n) \in A$  for infinitely many  $n$ .

**Remark 2.** In connection with Theorem 2, see [2].

The Baire set analogue of Theorem 2 is not true. In fact the following holds.

**Theorem 3.** *If  $A$  is a Baire subset of  $R$  and  $f: R \times R \rightarrow R$  is a function satisfying (d), (e) and (f) and  $(e_n)$  is a sequence converging to  $e$ , then the set  $A \setminus \{x \in A: f(x, e_n) \in A \text{ for all but finitely many } n\}$  is of the first Baire category.*

*Proof.* This result is immediate by the properties of  $f$  and the fact that  $A$  has the form  $A = (G \setminus P) \cup Q$ , where  $G$  is open and  $P$  and  $Q$  are sets of the first category.

#### REFERENCES

1. D. Borwein and S. Z. Ditor, *Translates of sequences in sets of positive measure*, Canad. Math. Bull. **21** (1978), 497–498.
2. H. I. Miller, *On certain transformations of sets*, Akad. Nauka Umjet. Bosne Hercegov. Rad. LXXVIII, 5–10.
3. J. C. Oxtoby, *Measure and Category*, Springer-Verlag, Berlin and New York, 1970.

DEPARTMENT OF MATHEMATICS, UNIVERSITY OF SARAJEVO 71000, YUGOSLAVIA